BOOK REVIEWS

LES INSTITUTIONS DE L'ANCIEN TESTAMENT 2. By R. de Vaux, O.P.

After the enthusiastic reception given the first volume of the series, it is unnecessary to insist on the unusual importance of its successor. The project, magnificently indexed for subject matter and biblical citations, is now complete; but the real worth of these two books will be apparent only after a student has made constant reference to them over a considerable span of time. The Institutions are not to be read through and shelved; the immense amount of information and carefully formed judgments, presumably the outgrowth of several decades of teaching in Jerusalem, make the work an indispensable tool of biblical study.

Military and religious, or more properly “cultic,” institutions are the subject of this much larger second volume. In a little over seventy-five pages, scarcely one sixth of the book, de Vaux describes the armed forces of Israel in the OT, her weapons, fortifications, and siege tactics, following with a short history of warfare in Israel. The last chapter of this section explains the idea of holy war, practically unknown today save for Islamic lands, but widespread in the ancient Near East. Herem, the culminating rite of holy war, is studied in the light of the biblical texts, some of which jar the modern reader. Yet the author reminds us that we still do not know the extent to which these prescriptions of total destruction were carried out in reality. In fact, most of the rules of herem are laid down in Dt, which was edited at a time when the practice of holy war was scarcely more than a memory.

The rest of the book, and by far the larger and more important part, consists in a systematic, up-to-date study of the cultic institutions of Israel. Sanctuaries, priesthood, forms of sacrifice, feasts, and calendars are some of the topics treated with constant reference to the OT text and other evidence. His extensive archeological work has given de Vaux access to an enormous amount of material which acts as a checkpoint on the literary sources, both biblical and nonbiblical. The more than fifty pages dealing with sacrifice are outstanding and should be brought to the attention of dogmatic theologians as well as biblical scholars. The whole sacrificial system, whether of OT or NT (and both are, of course, intimately related), is of cardinal importance in soteriology as well as in sacramental theology. The author’s synthesis describes the vocabulary of sacrifice, its origins, contemporary practice in Mesopotamia, Canaan (closest parallels to Israelite sacrifice), and elsewhere, concluding with reflections on the religious
significance of sacrifice in Israel. His study of the prophetic polemic against sacrifices comes to conclusions similar to those of H. H. Rowley and others.

Many reviewers will undoubtedly be impressed by the amplitude of information and prudence of judgment found in this volume. To these I think should be added the author's careful attention to sound method in handling this vast and often elusive material. For example, the whole question of sacrifice in Israel is extremely complex and difficult. The mingling of ancient with later practices, the borrowings from this or that culture, the unique elements in a given system of sacrifice are all factors which make this study so hazardous. De Vaux's brief description of his procedure (p. 306) is a model of good method. The same could be said for the study of Israelite feasts, in which theory and fact have not seldom been confused (see especially pp. 389–413). A bibliography of thirty pages, including the latest periodical literature, omits practically nothing necessary for further study of military and religious institutions in the OT.

Weston College

FREDERICK L. MORIARTY, S.J.


This monograph is a translation of Openbaringen uit Egyptisch Zand published in the Netherlands in 1958. One is a little surprised to find it numbered in the series of Studies in Biblical Theology, but its caliber is by no means unworthy of that excellent collection. The author is a professor of theology in the University of Utrecht, well known as editor of New Testament Studies (1954–57), Novum Testamentum, and Vigiliae christianae, and as author of books and numerous articles on the NT and early patristics. The translator, H. H. Hoskins, deserves better than the near anonymity of mention in a preface; in contrast to all too many recent translations, this one is excellent.

Sooner or later lay readers are going to be asking where to start making the acquaintance of the vast but elusive Gnostic movement now coming into slightly sharper focus with the slow publication of the Nag'-Hammâdi discoveries. This little book, in the reviewer's opinion, is as good a place as any to start, especially if the reader would avoid being discouraged at the outset by the bewildering complexity of the problem. Setting out to introduce the Nag'-Hammâdi manuscripts themselves, the author provides along the way an excellent introduction to Gnosticism itself and its relationship to early Christianity. If anything, he oversimplifies the picture; but in this
matter one might easily forgive such a lapse, at least if the reader be advised to take up one or more of the recent books of Jonas, Wilson, R. M. Grant, or Doresse as the second stage of his inquiry into Gnosticism.

The book begins with the story of the Nag'-Hammâdi discoveries—a story now often told—and a brief description of the codices and their contents. In the latter part of the second chapter van U. provides a brief sketch of the main tenets of Gnosticism, reducing them to four propositions about the unknown God, the imperfect Creator-God, the unsatisfactory situation of man in this world, and salvation through knowledge of self and of God. The scheme has the merit of trying to furnish a common denominator of Gnosticism, but one may well question whether these four propositions are an adequate delimitation of the phenomenon as distinct from other religious movements of antiquity. Wisely, however, the author does not confine the movement within the limits of a Christian heresy. His chapter on the background of Gnosticism shows clearly some of the contributions to this syncretism made by the major religions and philosophies of the ancient world.

Four chapters of the book are devoted to summarizing and discussing four of the works contained in the codices. The choice may have been dictated largely by the works available to the author, but it furnishes a good idea of the diversity of the materials in the Nag'-Hammâdi find. In the Gospel of Truth and the Apocryphon of John we are dealing with highly-developed Christian-Gnostic thought that strongly suggests the great systems of the second and third centuries. In the Gospel of Thomas and the Apocryphon of James, on the other hand, it may well be argued that we have apocryphal Christian works not originally Gnostic at all but used by Gnostics and in some cases edited by them. In these matters van Unnik prudently counsels awaiting further study before making definite conclusions.

In an epilogue the author sketches very summarily the significance of the Nag'-Hammâdi discoveries in relation to the NT. In general, his remarks are conservative, but it seems to me a bit too optimistic to expect from these Coptic documents any significant “positive results for textual criticism.” On the whole, the reviewer finds this monograph an attractive and reliable popular introduction to the present state of studies in Gnosticism.

Weston College

GEORGE MACRAE, S.J.

THE HOLY SPIRIT AND MODERN THOUGHT: AN ENQUIRY INTO THE HISTORICAL, THEOLOGICAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL ASPECTS OF THE CHRISTIAN
That the doctrine of the Holy Spirit needs reinterpreting today provides the starting point of Canon Dewar's study. Every age has to rediscover for itself the meaning of the great traditional dogmas. D., an Anglican, wishes to do it in this case in the light of the doctrinal tradition of the past and also in the light of modern psychological investigation, if modern psychology has something to say on the matter.

The OT's anticipation of the doctrine of the Holy Spirit is cursorily studied in a first part. The NT teaching comes next. The third part is devoted to "patristic and later teaching." The fourth and last part deals with the author's assessment of the modern scientific insight into spiritual matters, from which he draws what he calls "the psychological interpretation."

The first three parts present a fair, if incomplete, treatment of their topic. The data of the OT and NT are well used. There is no attempt at originality here, and Scripture scholars may find these pages somewhat pedestrian. Yet to students they will provide a good survey of the scriptural teaching on the Spirit. The third part presents the "patristic and later teaching" in a succession of rather unrelated sketches dealing with authors whom D. considers specially important. The great Fathers of the Church are surveyed, though too briefly to do them all justice: a little over one page covers St. Basil's De Spiritu sancto. There is an astonishing void between St. Augustine and Martin Luther, as though the Middle Ages' contribution to the theology of the Holy Spirit was nil. The question of the Filioque is surprisingly not considered. The thought of the Reformation is exemplified with Luther, Calvin, the Anglican Richard Hooker, and the Quaker George Fox. This seems a peculiar choice, but D. is aware of it: Fox was, he esteems, "an entirely illiterate person," but in fairness to the most radical wings of the Reformation, some representative of the "spiritual Reformers" had to be included.

D. hopes that his "psychological interpretation" will help to formulate a modern doctrine on the Spirit. Although he breaks new ground, he does not claim to do it in the best possible way. He simply tries to pioneer, thus running the risk of making serious mistakes. The main point of his approach consists in understanding the psi faculty, or extrasensory perception and action, as pointing to "natural operations" of the Holy Spirit. The objection that comes to mind here is that this is merely saying that God works through secondary causes. Just as God may heal through the instrumentality of a doctor, He may suggest a thought through extrasensory perception. The
psi faculty has no privilege of being an instrument of God's action. All our faculties may so be used by the Spirit.

This idea of the Spirit's activity through human faculties is applied to the "supernatural operations" of the Holy Spirit. Their description is satisfactory enough; and D. rightly insists that psychiatry becomes "far more intelligible if the movings of the unconscious at the deepest level are the movings of the Holy Spirit" (p. 174). Yet the radical distinction between the psychological and the supernatural seems hardly maintained in these pages. And without that distinction the Holy Spirit is in danger of losing His divinity.

Mount Mercy College, Pittsburgh

George H. Tavard


Dr. Muldoon, who since the publication of this third volume in his dogmatic theology series has been named auxiliary to Cardinal Gilroy of Sydney, Australia, here gives us the basic content of his lectures to the students of the Sydney Faculty of Theology. The treatment is faithful to the principles and methods of St. Thomas without losing sight of the problems and concerns of twentieth-century Catholicism. In three sections the book deals successively with the creation of the universe, with the divine governance of the world and of mankind in particular, and with the elevation and fall of the human race.

The universe was created by God, freely but not from eternity; God is also the exemplary and final cause of the universe. There is always the possibility of some confusion of concepts in developing the important doctrine of the ultimate purpose of creation; M.'s treatment of the subject is not completely successful in avoiding this. It is to be regretted that he apparently did not have at hand the articles of Philip Donnelly, S.J., on this matter which appeared some years ago in Theological Studies 2 (1941) 53–83; 4 (1943) 1–33. Discussing the origin of man, M. propounds, of course, the immediate creation of the individual human soul; he suggests as more probable, and indeed as the "doctrina communis," the immediate formation by God of the body of the first man from inorganic matter. Some eleven pages are devoted to an exposition of proofs of this position from the early chapters of Genesis and the writings of the Fathers. One may well question whether this interpretation may properly be called the common teaching today. There is a wealth of special pleading, not always either
convincing or persuasive, involved in the argumentation presented in its favor. At any rate one presumes that M. would be the last to insist that he has spoken the final word on the difficult questions regarding the origin of the body of the first man. This section on the origin and nature of man is followed by a brief but quite adequate study of the angels and their relationships with men.

The always knotty problem of the reconciliation of God’s absolute dominion over man with man’s power of free choice under the divine guidance is clearly explained in some fifty pages of text. Physical predetermination of the human will is rejected and by way of tentative solution the suggestion is made that there is a continuous divine influence exerted within the mind and will of man so adapted to the psychological structure and functioning of these faculties as to bring about the accomplishment of God’s will while man’s free choice remains truly his own.

The examination of man’s supernatural elevation in the person of Adam is introduced by a preliminary exposition of the essential concept of the supernatural and its distinction from the natural order in terms sufficient to accomplish the author’s main purpose of supplying the basic information needed by beginners in theology. The fundamental truths of the fall of Adam and its repercussions on his descendants are explained and demonstrated; this dogmatic exposition leads to a discussion of the nature of the original sin inherited by all from Adam. Here M. rejects as untenable the many theories of merely moral headship on Adam’s part and an exclusively moral or juridical solidarity between him and his offspring, with its various “pacts” expressed or implied between Adam and God, in favor of an explanation based on a physical, ontological solidarity of mankind with its progenitor as physical head of the race. M.—rightly, it seems to me—feels that within this framework of thought we must postulate a positive divine decree in virtue of which Adam’s original supernatural transformation was to be transmitted, had he not sinned, to all men as a state in which God willed that all should come into the world. Without some such positive determination of God’s will it is difficult to see how the absence of grace in the newly-born child would be in any true sense a state of sin.

The Latin text is always lucidly clear and not infrequently eloquently moving. This is clearly the work of a man who is at once an excellent teacher and a devoted scholar; the result is a splendid tribute to the theological erudition of the Australian clergy. Any adverse criticism we might make of this beautifully produced book would apply, I fear, with equal force to most theological textbooks available today. It concerns the difficulty which
the author in common with others evidently found in adapting to use in a manual such as this the wealth of material which modern Catholic biblical scholars are beginning to make available to dogmatic theologians. This is a task calling for time and patience. However pressing the problems involved, they will not be solved by any one man in any one book.

Woodstock College  

JOHN F. SWEENEY, S.J.


The doctrinal substance of this book is drawn from Fr. Flick’s lectures at the Gregorian University in Rome. The format adopted is an interesting attempt to mold this material to the needs of the educated layman or of the priest interested in renewing his theology in the light of contemporary developments. The title does not do justice to the whole content of the work, since the authors treat not only of God as Creator of the universe, but also of the nature and origin of man, of his elevation to the supernatural order, and his fall from grace through original sin. An effort is made, on the whole successfully, to discuss the pertinent points in the light of present-day thinking and to keep the discussion at all times on a consistently high theological level.

“We are convinced,” the authors say, “that all theology is linked with the salvation of man through Christ, and we have tried to emphasize this salvation aspect throughout. Our reflections on Christian life, therefore, are not merely ‘pious corollaries,’ but derive organically from the respective theses. We offer not sermon outlines but help to fuller understanding.” The salvation of man has in fact been made the unifying theme of the book. God created the world, but only with an eye to its dominance by a supernaturally elevated race of men to which the Son of God would one day belong. Creation, Paradise, and the Fall therefore constitute the beginning of the history of salvation, which in its historical reality means the return to man, through Christ and in superabundance, of all that mankind lost through Adam’s fall.

The first of the four chapters which comprise the book is concerned with the multitudinous relationships which link the universe with God as its Creator and its exemplary and final Cause. The material world is the gift of God’s eternal love for man, destined to evolve until it becomes the reflection of God’s own perfection to the degree willed by God. Man as the noblest element in this material universe, with his intelligence, power of free choice, and immortal soul, is the subject of the second chapter. His
soul has its origin in God's creative act; with regard to man's body, the authors acknowledge the possibility that it may derive from some previously existing lower organism, though not in the sense that the first man was the result of natural generation from a brute animal. The body of the first woman was probably formed from that of the first man, an opinion which will surely seem overconservative to many. However, the treatment of this difficult problem of evolution and its possible application to the origin of man is circumspect; it is based on wide familiarity with contemporary scientific, exegetical, and theological findings and is wisely made to subserve the primary concern of the scriptural sources to propound religious truth rather than to dispense scientific information.

Divine revelation paints, albeit only in very broad strokes, the picture of what the process of man's salvation would have been had sin not entered the world. This is the theme of the third chapter: the transformation of man through original grace and justice, the conferring on him of a new life whose conatural development was to have led to the beatific vision with no intervening separation of soul from body. The loss of this life of grace through the first sin is the unhappy story of man's first misuse of God's gift of free will. The definitive response to God’s initiative of love was rejection of His love and salvation. This is discussed in the final chapter, in many ways the most successful section of the work. The revealed truth of original sin, the nature of this sin and its effects in Adam's descendants, and the theological problems to which it gives rise form the main parts of the chapter. The authors’ summary of their analysis of the nature of original sin as it affects the family of Adam will give some idea of the content and tone of the book:

[The descendant of Adam] is born in a state of radical weakness, since on attaining the use of reason he finds himself incapable of choosing God as the summum bonum and accordingly incapable of avoiding mortal sin for long. Until the grace of Christ intervenes, the disorder of concupiscence, with the connivance of the devil, leading man to set himself up as the final goal of his own actions, will inevitably prevail. This moral weakness is, further, a 'state of sin,' since analogously to the state of personal sin it originates in a voluntary act of Adam as head of the human race. In our present economy the grace of Christ is offered to all adults to enable them to love God above all things with true charity and to live a moral life which is not merely natural but salutary, not merely worthy of man, but commensurate with his call to divine sonship. St. Thomas holds that this offer of grace is extended to all at the moment they become capable of moral action.

Original sin, then, consists in the inability of the sons of Adam to love God above all things. The privation of original justice is implicit in this condition not only because without this justice man can no longer love God in charity, but
because he finds himself without the strength necessary to meet successfully the problem of suffering, to vanquish concupiscence, and to resist the temptations of the devil. Concupiscence can, therefore, be called the material element in the state of original sin, because by drawing men towards creatures it impedes the will from turning to God. And the formal element of this state is the absence of this conversion of the will to God.

This state of culpable moral weakness makes the child of Adam unworthy of God's friendship as well as positively indisposed to receive grace. But if man is the son of the first sinful Adam, he is likewise the brother of the second Adam, with whom he shares a common humanity. This oneness with Christ transforms his misery into a title to God's help and to integration into the world redeemed by Christ, if only he consents to be reborn in Christ.

Neither in popular writings nor in the more scholarly literature of theology has the subject matter of this book been receiving in recent years the attention it merits. The story of man's origin and fall from grace is not indeed an inspiring one in itself. When, however, it is examined, as it is here, in the light of the salvation of mankind through Christ, it is seen to be the prologue to that salvation and the only background against which we can reach a Christian understanding of man and his existential situation. It is the merit of the authors to have put this emphasis on a subject which the Christian, be he theologian or not, can neglect only at his own peril.

*Woodstock College*  
*JOHN F. SWEENEY, S.J.*


Originally planned by its promoters as an offering to the late Pius XII on the sixtieth anniversary of his ordination to the priesthood, this encyclopedic collection of studies on the doctrinal, historical, and pastoral contents and background of the Encyclical *Haurietis aquas*, on devotion to the Sacred Heart of Jesus, stands as an inspiring tribute to the memory of the Holy Father. The editors succeeded in finding first-rate collaborators from many countries to supply a series of scholarly studies by way of commentary on the Encyclical and in the form of development of many of the themes suggested therein. The essays appear in a number of different languages, the competence of the contributors is more than adequate, and the coverage is broad and comprehensive.

As the now Cardinal Bea notes in his "Presentazione," two encyclical letters of Pius XII's recent predecessors stressed one or other important
aspect of devotion to our Lord under the symbol of His Sacred Heart, the *Annum sacrum* of Leo XIII (May 25, 1899) being especially concerned with the consecration of the human race to the Heart of Jesus, and the *Miserentissimus redemptor* of Pius XI (May 8, 1928) setting forth the theory and practice of the reparation to the Sacred Heart through which sinful man should seek forgiveness and grace from the Redeemer. In contrast, *Haurietis aquas* has a much broader scope, since it aims at nothing less than a complete exposition of the theology of the mystery of the Saviour’s Heart and of the devotion of the Church to Christ under this symbol, with special focus on the problems the devotion had been encountering in the twentieth century. For this reason, while the Encyclical repeats the fundamental truth that the fleshly Heart of Christ, as being hypostatically united to the divine Person of the Word, is to be adored with the same cultus which the Church offers to the divine Person, Pius XII preferred to lay greater emphasis on “another motive particularly applicable to the Heart of the divine Redeemer,” which in a special way is “the symbol of His great love for mankind, a love which includes, in addition to the human love of Christ’s human Heart, the love too of the three divine Persons as the origin and source of the redemption of mankind.”

In one way or another each of the essays in the collection stresses this predominant theme of the Encyclical, the divine and human redemptive love symbolized by our Lord’s human Heart. The first volume gathers together the studies of doctrinal import, the second being devoted to historical and pastoral considerations. Vol. 1 opens with three introductory articles which center about the essential thesis of the Encyclical, that devotion to the Sacred Heart as approved and encouraged by the Church is a devotion with roots deeply embedded in Christian revelation. José de Aldama, S.J., in “Tres encíclicas pontificias sobre el culto al Sagrado Corazón,” correlates the three encyclicals we have mentioned to bring out the development of the official teaching of the Church on the nature and foundations of the devotion. Of particular interest are the author’s observations on the subsidiary but stimulative role of private revelations in the growth of the devotion. The Church has more and more clearly insisted that the cult is solidly grounded in the Christian revelation itself, thus confirming the position of contemporary theologians regarding the purely secondary function of private revelation in Christian thought and life. A similar point is made from a very different approach to the matter in “Mirabilis progressio: Gedanken zur Geschichtstheologie der Herz-Jesu-Verehrung,” where Hugo Rahner, S.J., after a very sketchy survey of the history of the devotion, argues that the remarkable growth of the devotion to which
Pius XII refers is due above all to its fundamentally ecclesial nature. It is a devotion whose supports lie deep within the Church, since it is nothing less than a concrete expression of the very nature of the Church and of its worship of the Incarnate Word. The noted liturgist, Annibale Bugnini, C.M., in “Le messe del SS. Cuore di Gesù,” demonstrates how, from the first of the Masses in honor of the Sacred Heart approved by the Church, the Gaudeamus of St. John Eudes, to our present day Cogitationes, the liturgical formulae have incorporated a notable emphasis on the biblical theme of redemptive love in this most effective form of Christian teaching.

Over the years theological discussions and analyses of the object of devotion to the Sacred Heart have seemed often to complicate the matter beyond all understanding. Haurietis aquas wisely recalled the essentials, and these are examined by Giuseppe Filograssi, S.J., in his discussion “De obiecto cultus SS. Cordis Iesu in litteris encyclicis ‘Haurietis aquas.’” He rightly insists that Pius XII taught that the object of the devotion is the fleshly Heart of the Saviour as symbol of the divine love for mankind. The complete object of the cultus includes the divine Person of Christ, the divine love common to the Father and the Holy Spirit, the love of the whole Trinity, the human love of Christ, both spiritual and “sensitive,” together with the entire interior life of the man Christ inasmuch as His physical Heart was “informed” by His human and divine love, and finally the fleshly Heart itself of the Incarnate Word wherein we have, in the Holy Father’s words, “presented before our eyes the whole of the love with which He embraced and still embraces us.”

Some of the fundamental Christian implications of the devotion are brought to light and studied in four related essays. “La SS. Trinità e il Cuore SS. di Gesù,” by Luigi Ciappi, O.P., discusses the relations between the Heart of Jesus and the Trinity, with primary stress on the value of these relationships for the development of Christian spirituality. In “L’ Esprit du Coeur de Jésus,” Herman Diepen, O.S.B., points out in the spirit of Benedictine spirituality the many ways in which the Holy Spirit is the Gift par excellence of the threefold love of the Redeemer. The Spirit is truly the Gift of the Sacred Heart to men. The bonds which link the Heart of Christ to His Mystical Body are the subject of an informative study by Joseph Lécuyer, C.S.Sp.; in similar vein Sebastian Tromp, S.J., explores the relationships between the Sacred Heart and the Church both as Mystical Body and as Spouse of Christ. José Solano, S.J., in a theological interpretation of patristic teaching on the nature of the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass, concludes that, since devotion to the Sacred Heart strongly attracts men to the love Christ bears for them, and the Mass, as the renewal of Calvary,
brings Christ crucified for love of men into renewed presence among them, the Mass will always stand as the most adequate expression of what Pius XII speaks of as the essential devotion to Christ's Heart.

A further series of articles is concerned with the scriptural and patristic sources of the basic elements of this devotion. Johannes Kahmann, C.SS.R., writes on the manifestations of God's love for man in the OT; Rafael Criado, S.J., examines the OT symbols of divine love; and this study is complemented by an intriguing essay on the theology of symbols by Karl Rahner, S.J. The first of the two articles written in English is an interpretation of Jn 7:38, "From His Heart will flow rivers of living water," a masterly study by David Stanley, S.J.; this is followed by Salvatore Garofalo's synthesis of Pauline doctrine. Somewhat surprisingly, the only treatment of patristic sources in the collection is Charles Boyer's twenty-four-page article on St. Augustine's conception of our Lord's threefold love for men.

Granted the broad scope of the Encyclical, it would be too much to expect it to have offered definitive answers to all the questions which can be asked concerning the mystery of Christ's love for His Father and His fellow men. Much is left to theological reflection and study. The remaining articles of this first volume take up a number of such problems. One of the most suggestive essays is Carlo Colombo's "Il triplice amore di Cristo e la psicologia di nostro Signore." The effort to understand the human psychology of the God-man is one of the more difficult problems Catholic theology has confronted in recent years. As the author says, Christ's "psychology" is necessarily unique and offers a problem which reaches to the very roots of the mystery of the Incarnation. An insight into the interior human life of the Saviour demands a completely adequate theological approach, one with all the necessary stress on the deductive process as well as on the inductive. This involves the application of other established theological truths concerning our Lord to the essential data of His words and deeds as these are recorded for us by His contemporaries and their followers. The author's methodological principles are as interesting as his conclusions. It must suffice to note here his insistence on one over-all guiding principle, "that the humanity of Christ is the humanity of the Word, and not of God in an indeterminate sense; consequently, the human psychology of Christ is the psychology of the humanity of the Word and hence is directly and immediately revelatory of the divine Person of the Word."

The second of the English-language essays is by Bernard Leeming, S.J., "Consecration to the Sacred Heart." The title hardly suggests the full content of the article, which combines most felicitously theological erudition
and good common sense. It is certainly one of the best contributions to this first volume. Few if any of the many questions raised in recent times, even since the publication of *Haurietis aquas*, have escaped Fr. Leeming's notice, and his discussion of them will surely satisfy all those who understand, as he says so well, that there are "certain Christian and Catholic instincts and feelings and even to question them is proof of an unchristian, uncatholic mind." Two further articles, one by A. Piolanti, the other by Henri Rondet, S.J., examine the many facets of the relationships between the sufferings and joys of Christ's Heart on the one hand and sin and reparation from men on the other. The volume concludes with a study of the Encyclical and devotion to the Immaculate Heart of Mary, by Franz Lakner, S.J.

The historical and pastoral implications of *Haurietis aquas* form the subject matter of the fourteen articles which make up the second volume. The profound harmony between devotion to the Sacred Heart and the distinctive spirit of the various religious orders in the Church emerges from monographs on the Benedictine, Dominican, Francisian, and Jesuit adoption of the devotion as integral to the spiritual life of their members. The profound influence of St. Margaret Mary Alacoque in the growth and development of the devotion is admirably documented by Giovanni Zoré, S.J.; the historical background of the condemnation of the errors of the Synod of Pistoia in regard to devotion to the Sacred Heart (DB 1561-63) is explained by B. Matteucci; and M. Gordillo, S.J., contributes an interesting elucidation of the trends among the dissident Orientals which might indicate an openness to devotion to the Heart of our Redeemer. The remaining articles are largely concerned with various pastoral aspects and applications of the devotion and furnish striking proof of the vitality of the devotion and of the wide and deep penetration of this most Catholic of cults into the spiritual life of the Church. An invaluable historical and bibliographical survey of the vast literature connected with devotion to the Sacred Heart, some 136 pages in length, by Roberto Tucci, S.J., is a fitting crown to these monumental volumes. The Catholic world is deeply in debt to the editors and their many collaborators for this encyclopedic collection of studies. The great variety of languages in which the contributions appear, Latin, French, Italian, Spanish, English, and German, will undoubtedly prove a stumbling block to many prospective readers, but the two volumes will for many years remain a very necessary addition to our theological libraries.

*Woodstock College*

*John F. Sweeney, S.J.*

The author's stated purpose being "to proceed with as much certainty as possible, certain questions are not discussed, as for instance whether the Blessed Virgin enjoyed the use of reason from the first moment of her existence, what was the extent of her knowledge, whether she had the beatific vision or any form of infused knowledge, what sacraments she received, etc. . . . Such questions do not seem to belong to a strictly theological treatise." The development of those Marian questions which are discussed is further guided by the principle that "if speculative theology is not firmly rooted in positive theology, solid progress will hardly be made," especially in Mariology. This norm is applied throughout by the continued consultation of scriptural, patristic, and theological sources which has been characteristic of Fr. Lennerz' other writings.

The first part of the book, under the heading "Mary in se," includes theses on her divine motherhood, her perpetual virginity, the Immaculate Conception, and the Assumption. In the second section, which is concerned with our Lady's part in the divine economy of salvation, some thirty-five pages survey the pertinent biblical and patristic source material; this is followed by a study of similar length on the nature of Mary's universal mediation and her function as mother of mankind. A final section of some sixty pages is entitled "De nova quadem opinione." This is a study of the thorny problem of the role of the Mother of God as coredemptress. L.'s position here is probably well-known; it is not calculated to please those who are strongly convinced that Mary played a positive and immediate, though subordinate, part in the "objective" redemption. The question to be answered, as the author sees it, is, "Has God revealed that the human race was redeemed solely by the work of Christ, or by the work of Christ together with that of the Blessed Virgin?" The answer given is that neither in Holy Scripture nor in the writings of the Fathers, neither in the doctrine of the theologians nor in the official teaching of the Church, can we find any solid grounds for asserting such positive and immediate co-operation of our Lady with Christ in the working out of man's redemption from sin. "The Church, therefore, knows one Redeemer only, only one who acquired grace for us; it knows only the work of Christ through which alone mankind was reconciled with God." Whatever one may think of L.'s position on this and other controverted questions, his judgment is always expressed lucidly, strongly, and with an evident desire that the truth may prevail. The arguments on both sides are stated fairly and the conclusions are reached honestly. It is consequently always possible for the reader to reach his own
conclusions through an impartial evaluation of the evidence thus clearly presented.

*Woodstock College*  
*John F. Sweeney, S.J.*


This volume is part of a series intended to provide an interdenominational and international forum for the discussion of theoretical and practical issues in the life of the Church. The author of this contribution confines himself to a study of the close connection between baptism and the Eucharist and to some practical problems which arise on the liturgical level because of this relationship. Beginning with an analysis of the rites of initiation and sacrifice in "lower religions," E. finds that the fundamental object of all ordeals of initiation is the burial of the dead. The various forms of ritual burial are seen as prototypes of every kind of sacrifice. According to E., in the "lower religions" there is an acceptance of the necessity of ritual death "for the all-devouring, self-regarding, insatiable infant, that the child may mature in company, and become in time a member of a society linking the living and the dead with the unborn who are still to be" (p. 105). It is the dim recognition of such a necessity which lies behind the anxiety of families who do not practice the Christian religion to have their children baptized. Such concern, according to E., should be interpreted in relation to the Christian doctrine of sin. It will be relieved by the Christian vision of baptism and the Eucharist as communion in the death and resurrection of Christ, a historical event which is renewed daily in the Eucharist. The Eucharist, then, becomes the sacramental way by which Christ's death and resurrection and our baptism are renewed in us. In the course of the book E. treats of other initiations (marriage, coronation) in connection with the Eucharistic mystery.

This study is, on the whole, a commendable effort to emphasize the unity between baptism and the Eucharist, especially since it stresses thereby the need for frequent Communion. However, it is disappointing not to find a more penetrating investigation of the sacrificial aspect of the Eucharist. Also on the debit side, it appears that E.'s description of the meaning of certain rites in "lower religions" is too simplified. He generalizes too readily, tending to ignore the fact that symbolic rites do have a history, are influenced by the cultures into which they are assimilated, and even undergo an internal evolution within a particular culture. Furthermore, to say that "the rituals of initiation are directed to the discipline of affection,
and to the death of the demanding self who insists on a mother's love and a sister's servile attention" (p. 17) seems too rational to be primitive.

Weston College Edward J. Kilmartin, S.J.


We often look back with envy at the age of the Fathers, when theology addressed itself to the whole man, not just to his intellect. This book tries to do the same and in a rather novel way. Though it begins as a history of the theology of marriage, the chapter headings reveal the author's purpose: "Indissolubility—The Church and the Barbarians"; "The Pauline Privilege—The Discovery of the New World"; "The Meaning and End of Marriage—Present-day Discussions." Revealed truths strike the mind with new vividness when seen against this background of the Church's actual life. The truths which emerge are arranged into six chapters of "Doctrinal Conclusions." Two appendices present the Council of Trent's decree on the sacrament of matrimony and the decision of the Holy Office in 1944 on the interrelation of the ends of marriage. The book ends with a bibliography on the major periods reviewed in the survey.

Père Rondet is to be commended for this historical approach. Many problems in the theology of marriage can hardly be appreciated, let alone solved, in any other way. In fact, the longer scholars work on the theology of marriage, the more apparent it becomes that such basic concepts in theology as the consent of theologians or the sensus fidelium have far more depth and complexity than is usually suggested. The time dimension in revelation has yet to be fully explored, and in this study of marriage we have a case history of the way in which dogma evolves.

The book is easy reading, even for a layman; but there is documentation for almost every page. R. moves easily through problem areas. His judgment is sound, and he faithfully distinguishes what is still in dispute from the acknowledged body of doctrine. His use of the expressions "glory of God" and "bonum diffusivum sui" might be open to question, but the context shows that he is merely borrowing them to describe a position to which no one would take exception. Typical of his general attitude is a remark on the rigorism which so often appears in theologians of former times: "To react against one excess, let us not throw ourselves into another. Let us not allow the impression to arise that everything 'natural' is good, that we can supernaturalize it without a slight dose of renunciation."
Much of the work on this book seems to have been done a long time before it was published. Current authors are cited, but on the whole the documentation and bibliography are dated. A subject index would seem to be more useful than the mere list of authors which is provided.

R. has nothing very new to say. His method limits him to a general survey, and most of his work was done some time ago. But this remark is not a censure. He calls his book an “Introduction” to the theology of marriage. It is a good one and worth translating into English.

*Wheeling College, W.Va.*

**Joseph E. Kerns, S.J.**


In translating ten of the thirteen papers given at the Third National Congress (Strasbourg, 1958) of the Centre de pastorale liturgique and published in France as *Parole de Dieu et liturgie* (Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959; *Lex orandi* 25), the Liturgical Press has added a significant volume to its already impressive list of first-rate works on the liturgy. In his brief introduction Canon Martimort states the theme around which all the papers center: “no liturgical progress is possible without the Biblical education of Christians, since without the Bible there is no liturgy” (p. xiv). Four major areas are explored: the use of the Bible in the liturgy (Jounel, Bouyer, Roguet, Gelineau); the relation of Bible-liturgy to Christian life (Moeller, Coudreau, Lécuyer, Spuelbeck); divine revelation in human language (Urs von Balthasar); the sacraments and the history of salvation (Daniélou).

Each essay is scholarly, reflective, and thought-provoking. This very fact makes a reviewer wish that certain questions were more directly faced, if indeed they arose at all in the minds of the writers. “The Bible in the liturgy”—but does the liturgy reflect the Bible without “distortion,” if we may use this word neutrally? The answer, obviously enough, is no. This observation, which ought to have been made often in certain essays, e.g., Daniélou’s, raises the question of literary genres, first in patristic writing, secondly within the liturgy itself. Liturgical usage does not usually mirror faithfully the literal sense and contextual relationships of the biblical texts cited or alluded to; until this is recognized and not glossed over as unimportant, the originality of the liturgy, its own inner laws of composition, and its theological and doctrinal function cannot be appreciated. Inseparably connected, in turn, with the liturgical use of Scripture is the liturgical view of the “history of salvation.” The liturgy, like the Fathers, recognizes, of course, and is in a sense built on the idea of the history of salvation; but,
paradoxical though it may sound, the liturgy, again like the Fathers whose thought the liturgy largely reflects, has a quite unhistorical view of the history of salvation (cf. Georges Jouassard, "Les Pères devant la Bible: Leurs perspectives particulières," in *Études de critique et d'histoire religieuses* [= *Mélanges Vaganay*; Lyons: Facultés catholiques, 1948] pp. 25–33). This is not meant, of course, as a condemnation of the liturgy; it is only to say that the theological nature and function of the liturgy must be understood and respected. This is all the more important today when many of the laity are becoming more acquainted with and sensitive to the Scriptures and their proper meaning; to fail to advert to the special nature of the liturgical use of Scripture can only work, eventually, to the detriment of the liturgy.

Especially worth while is Charles Moeller's essay, "Is it possible in the twentieth century to be a 'Man of the Bible'?" His starting point is certain elements of the biblical-liturgical view of the world, and the obstacles that exist to the acceptance of these in the contemporary mind; he notes the steppingstones which, however, also exist in this same mind, and proposes in broad terms an answer to his title-question. (Cf. M.'s complementary essay, "L'Homme d'aujourd'hui devant la piété biblique et liturgique," *Questions liturgiques et paroissiales* 40 [1959] 289–306.)

Woodstock College

M. J. O'Connell, S.J.


It is unfortunate that the title does not immediately reveal the scope and purpose of this valuable book. It suggests just another attempt to stimulate and assist the parochial clergy in their endeavors to make the Mass a more vivid reality to their people. Yet the title is really a good one when its true significance is understood. This is only possible if we know the anecdote from which it is derived. Once, when the late Holy Father, Pius XII, was addressing a group of European liturgists before one of their study meetings, he pointed out to them that hitherto the liturgists had been striving with commendable success to "bring the people to the Mass" by means of such methods as dialog Mass and so on, but they seemed to have reached an impasse. The time had now come, he continued, to "bring the Mass to the people" by reform and adaptation of the Mass itself, and he hoped that before he came to die he would be able to achieve so much in this sphere that the advance would have become irreversible and clear principles would have been established for the future. R.'s book, then, is a book about the
reforms and adaptations that might be made in furtherance of the plan to "bring the Mass to the people."

But even now we must beware of placing the book in the wrong category. The proposals it sets forth are not those of any individual, however zealous and well-informed—as R. himself is—but they are the serious suggestions of eminent liturgical scholars, pastors, and bishops, made at various congresses or in important publications. All these suggestions are carefully analyzed and explained by one who, as Fr. McManus writes in the Introduction, "brings to his study years of devoted pastoral experience and the widest reading."

It is common knowledge that a thorough reform of the Latin rite is being prepared. Ever since the pontificate of St. Pius X various aspects of this reform have been the subject of continuous discussion. It is very largely the consequence of such discussion that recent years have witnessed a number of important liturgical changes—most notably the restoration of Holy Week in 1955. More recently the Instruction on Sacred Music and Liturgy of September, 1958, has indicated the serious concern of the ecclesiastical authorities with the problems of the Mass and the people. But the proposals therein set forth were not and could not be regarded as permanent and final. Even the dialog Mass (if our anecdote of Pius XII is authentic) might "bring the people to the Mass," but it does not "bring the Mass to the people." Furthermore, the singing or saying of vernacular prayers, no matter how appropriate, while Mass is going on, is not really participating in the Mass itself, and may be a positive source of distraction both to the priest at the altar and to those who use their missals. All such proposals for closer lay participation can only be regarded as interim expedients, pending a reform of the Mass itself. They do not finally and effectively "bring the Mass to the people."

R.'s purpose is to inform English-speaking Catholics about the state of the discussion, especially in regard to the Mass, and to indicate the kind of reforms which are most likely to result. It is important that people should know the direction in which authority is likely to move, and for that they must be aware of what has been proposed by competent scholars, pastors, and bishops. R. has wisely restricted himself to the parochial Mass and its problems, omitting all consideration of the different problems of cathedrals and collegiate churches. Moreover, he considers only such proposals as concern the specifically ritual aspects of the Mass. Other questions, such as vesture, music, etc., are outside the scope of the book. He also avoids the thorny question of language, although it might have been suggested, in a book concerned solely with the parochial Mass, that here if anywhere
the vernacular might find a place. Without some such concession in the sphere of language it is not easy to see how it would be possible in any full sense to “bring the Mass to the people.” Perhaps Appendix D (referred to on p. 36, but nowhere to be found) was originally intended to cover this matter and then the author’s courage failed him.

It is not too much to say that this book deserves to be read and studied by every intelligent Catholic, whether priest or layman.

_Downside Abbey, Bath, England_  
A. Gregory Murray, O.S.B.


This survey of the work of Prof. Cullmann provides a bibliography of his writings down to the end of 1959 that must be complete, since it has been elaborated with his help and his secretary’s. The survey itself may be divided into three sections: methodological, dogmatic, and critical. There is also a list of some of the major reviews, Catholic and Protestant, of C.’s chief publications.

First of all, there are principles to settle about the way in which the NT material is to be used in the making of a theology of the primitive Church, principles which C. took over from the Form-Critics, but in which he did not agree with Bultmann. His own position was (and is) rendered peculiar by a reluctance to accept the idea of a living tradition, as his argument with Daniélou was to bring out. When F. comes to the criticism of these principles (in his third section, pp. 226–29), he does well to cite the draft canons on the infallibility of the Church which Kleutgen had prepared for the Vatican Council: the Church was declared to be incapable of falling away from the faith sive credendo sive docendo. C.’s studies on the primitive professions of faith enabled him, as he thought, to seize upon the very nucleus of primitive Christian belief. F. does not point out how mistaken was C.’s idea that these primitive creeds were in use on all manner of occasions, for the liturgy, for baptism, for exorcism even, so that they might be thought to give all that was considered vital at an early age of development. They cannot, in fact, be shown to have been used on any other occasion than for baptism, and the notable omission in all of them of any mention of the Eucharist seems likely to be due to the simple fact that the Eucharist was not explained to the catechumens until after their baptismal creed. F. is ready with plenty of philosophical criticism, whether of Bult-
mann's a priori philosophical presuppositions or of C.'s reaction away from these, but he might have given more attention to the lowly work of testing theories by facts. F. criticizes the notion of biblical theology which C. adopts, but one may doubt if his criticism goes far enough. He points out that C. is really a stranger to the idea that Scripture has to be read in the light of the interpretation given to it by the Church, but he seems to take for granted the very controversial view that every Christian doctrine is adequately contained in Scripture, a view that has been energetically combatted by Lennerz and by others not so long ago.

When F. comes to deal with C.'s dogmatic positions, he is mainly concerned with his Christology and with his ideas of the Church. The argument of C.'s book on St. Peter is summarized, but the criticism of the book is poor. No attempt is made to show that C. is wrong in supposing that Peter handed over the primacy to James, though it is said in a footnote that certain Catholics have urged that C.'s reliance on the Clementine documents for the authority of James is unwarranted. F. seems to think that the question does not matter to C.'s position and that it is enough to confront him with the fact of Peter's going to Rome and dying there, coupled with the claim of later popes to the primacy, to leave him without a possibility of caviling at our position. In all this, F. seems not sufficiently to distinguish the apologetic argument from the dogmatic argument. To an inquirer one has to give the plain historical reasons why the Church has an infallible head, and no amount of talk about positivism and transcendence (in which the book is not lacking) can burke the hard necessity. It is quite another thing to theologize about the position of the Church in the scheme of divine Providence and its relation to human history. For C., the Church undergoes a strange transformation at the death of the last apostle; a theological ice age sets in, and the function of tradition, once it has fixed the canon of the Scripture, seems to atrophy. He cannot consistently contemplate the transmission of such doctrines as that of the working of the sacraments \textit{ex opere operato} through the rite of infant baptism. (If Polycarp, who was baptized in infancy by an apostle, received supernatural benefit thereby—and it looks as if he thought that he did—then one has to ask why the minister of the rite at the time thought it worth while to practice it upon an infant.) C.'s Lutheran positions remain Lutheran, even when combined with a philosophy of time, and one could have wished that they had been more thoroughly scrutinized than they are in this book.

\textit{London, England} \hspace{1cm} J. H. Crehan, S.J.

The shape that the "dialogue" between Protestants and Catholics in America is taking is highly interesting and not a little puzzling. It is interesting because, if not many persons yet take part in it, it is at least conducted on a high intellectual level among first-rate thinkers. It is puzzling because it is more like a series of monologues than a genuine dialogue in which each speaks and listens in turn.

We find this relative absence of relatedness in the two parts of An American Dialogue: "A Protestant Looks at Catholicism," by Robert McAfee Brown, and "A Catholic Looks at Protestantism," by Fr. Weigel. Each is written with accuracy, understanding, and a reasonable degree of sympathy for what it looks at; yet the two do not totally correspond to each other.

B. attempts a constructive essay on how and why Catholicism "got that way," and he surveys hopefully the points of contact or rapprochement that have lately appeared in several countries. He studies the past history of Protestant-Catholic relations, the history of American Catholicism, the question of "Catholic power," the possibilities and difficulties of a dialogue, and the current development of ecumenism. He clearly wishes to contribute, not only an objective description of some aspects of American pluralism, but also a tentative program for an ecumenical encounter. He talks to Catholics of all kinds, bingo players as well as bishops and theologians, hoping that they will listen.

W., in his contribution, does not try to start an ecumenical dialogue. It would even seem to be implied in his conclusion that such a dialogue is ultimately impossible, simply because "the two principles" of Catholicism and Protestantism "implicitly deny each other at every point" (p. 192). His essay is a highly illuminating analysis of Protestantism as it appears in its piety, in its ethics, in its "stance," and in its fear. It is also an effort to determine the basic nature of the "Protestant principle," as W., in his contacts with Protestants and his knowledge of Protestant literature, has learned to understand it. From the point of view of the ecumenical enthusiast, this may mark a step back from the engaging, though restrained, optimism of B.'s opening of the dialogue. Yet for the sake of the dialogue itself, however distant it may still remain, analyses in depth, of the kind that W. has done, are a preliminary requirement. We must know to whom we are speaking, and we can only know it from the depth of our own theology as it reflects on Protestant reality. The dialogue between Catholicism and
Protestantism must include a dialogue with oneself concerning the other. In contrast to B., who talks to Catholics mainly, W. in this essay talks to himself about what Catholics see in Protestantism. Not all Catholics, not even all students of Protestantism, will agree with his interpretation. It seems somewhat arbitrary to the present reviewer to try to reduce to one explanation phenomena as varied as Anglo-Catholicism on the one hand, and the appearance of Jehovah's Witnesses on the other. Yet W.'s attempt has over many others the advantage of being consistent and meaningful. W.'s conclusion adds a warning that both Catholics and Protestants need to keep in mind. Ecumenism in America is in danger of absorption in the American way of life: "In both groups what we need is a strong prophetic voice warning the people against the worship of Moloch" (p. 208).

Mount Mercy College, Pittsburgh

GEORGE H. TAVARD


Readers of THEOLOGICAL STUDIES do not have to be told of the interdenominational thaw that set in among various groups of European Christians during World War II. What began amid the extraordinary conditions created by the war as a program of mutual charity and helpfulness gradually led to a new spirit of cordial relations that spread to other lands. Thus, today there is a growing consciousness in virtually all Western countries—except, perhaps, in Latin America—of the value to be derived from getting to know and to understand the doctrinal and devotional positions of one's brothers in other Christian communions. That this increasing familiarity and friendliness, when conducted with prudence and common sense, is an altogether wholesome development is beyond question. And that the atmosphere created in most places by this kind of exchange has been conducive to one of the principal objectives originally stated for the summoning of a new ecumenical council would also seem to be obvious.

If, however, the conversations of sincere men of every shade of Christian belief are to produce the best results, each must re-examine the original position of his own allegiance, as well as that of his opposite number, so that there may take place a clearing away, so to speak, of certain obstacles accumulated by centuries of prejudice and ignorance. First, then, there must be a clarification of what at the outset was meant by the issues that originally divided men, how these differences developed in history, and what traditions each side at present regards as basic to its position, and
what ones it may view as perhaps accidental and therefore subject to alteration and accommodation in order the more readily to narrow the gulf that divides them from other Christians.

Among these differences it would be difficult to think of one that has proved more effective in its divisiveness than that dealing with religious liberty, or the lack of it. It is to this subject that Dr. Carrillo, research associate of the World Council of Churches, addresses himself here in five brief chapters that treat of the following aspects of the problem: the question of whether the theory of "thesis and hypothesis" is the only Catholic doctrine on religious liberty; the concept as seen in Catholic tradition; the nature, sphere, and limits of religious liberty; and finally, Catholicism and ecumenism on matters of religious liberty. For those who are aware that the author has changed his religious allegiance from the Catholicism in which he was born and raised, and for that reason might view his book with some suspicion, let it be said that C. gives every evidence of objectivity and fairness in this thoroughly documented brochure. The theological works of numerous Catholic writers—all bearing the ecclesiastical imprimatur—have been carefully combed for evidence that supports religious freedom for all denominations. It will come as a surprise, I suspect, to some Catholics to learn how many qualified theologians of their Church have been writing and teaching in this vein, some of them since the early years of the present century. In fact, I was so surprised at the number and stature of these men that I was prompted to inquire of several theologians why their teaching had not been made more widely known in American Catholic seminaries. I say "made known," since only about six or seven Americans are cited and of these only one is quoted more than two or three times.

In this regard it is interesting to find C. disagreeing with Prof. John C. Bennett of Union Theological Seminary in the latter's statement that American Catholics have found their arguments in favor of religious freedom chiefly "with support from Catholics in Europe" (Christians and the State [New York, 1958] p. 267). C. maintains that American writers have given their principal emphasis to juridical and political arguments for religious freedom, and he is of the opinion that in so far at least as theological arguments among the Americans are concerned, Bennett is wrong and "the opposite would seem nearer the reality" (p. 51, n. 1).

The chief value of this work is as a source book for Catholic theological opinion favoring religious freedom. Anyone who might have thought that the "thesis and hypothesis" theory was the only admissible one among Catholics will quickly change his mind once he has read here the unbroken line of evidence that stretches from Arthur Vermeersch, S.J., in 1912 to
Cardinal Lercaro in 1958. In other words, C. has made an important contribution to a better understanding of a neglected aspect of the Catholic side of this critical question, and every informed Catholic, clerical and lay alike, should make himself aware of the contents of these pages. Only three minor slips were noticed, and these can easily be taken care of in another printing: for "Nicholas" read "McNicholas" (p. 13); for "American" read "America" (p. 51); and the article should be eliminated in the sentence introducing the quotation from Pius XII (p. 64).

Catholic University of America

JOHN TRACY ELLIS


Dr. Cragg's book is the first volume of the Christian Presence Series, other volumes of which will deal with the Christian Presence amid Hinduism, Buddhism, etc. In a General Introduction the general editor, M. A. C. Warren, indicates the spirit in which this series has been undertaken by the following quotation from another work of C.: "There is ... a great need for a discerning trusteeship of Christ which can undertake an irenic and yet loyal witness to the meaning of the Gospel, without capitulating either to easy neglect of truth or to assertive and alienating advocacy of it." The series is an effort to suggest a "frontier theology." This is described by Warren as "a theology born of the experiences we have when we move out from our own central assumptions to meet the central assumptions of other men." C., after enumerating the customary theological disciplines, asks: "Why not also a theology that is outward and relational, having to do not merely with what is for those within but what offers for those without—a theology, in short, which is on the frontiers of religions in their mutual existence?" The Catholic theologian would doubtless regard this as a part of the recently developed science of missiology, though the basic factors involved have never been alien to Catholic dogmatic theology, where they find their justification and true relevance.

In the first part, "In Quest of Islam," C. shows himself a sympathetic interpreter of the Islam which lies beyond "the assorted footwear which accumulates outside the mosque, worn and torn in the ways of life and dusty with the actual world." The work is not intended to be a manual of Islamics. However, the first part gives the reader a kind of ideal view of the spirit of Islam and underlines some of the main problems which modern Islam faces.

In the second part, "Conditions of Inter-Religion," C. is concerned with
a concept which, whatever its psychological and purely human connotations may be, is surely very debatable from a theological viewpoint. The great religions of the world obviously coexist in time, and often in space. We may also admit that they "are compelled by events to address themselves to the same problems." But the precise meaning of the "inter" in interreligion is not made clear and cogent by affirming that the latter ultimately "only becomes possible because that to which religions relate is the common denominator of human nature." Again, it is not sufficiently precise to assert that "Religions, across all their disparities, are about the same thing and have to do with the same world, with the heart of man and the finitude of life." Nor does it seem quite true to say that "Islam and Christianity deal fundamentally with the same things and to a significant extent deal with them in the same way.... Prophecy, worship, prayer, mercy, law, Scriptures, patriarchs, God's signs in nature, creation and sin—all these are religious categories having to do with the Divine relation to the human situation." In the case of almost every one of these "categories" the Christian and Islamic positions are essentially and fundamentally diverse. It is not so much a question of "a single human context" as of a single divine context, in which there can be only one divinely willed religion, and in which the existence of other religions creates an unnatural—or better, "unsupernatural"—tension that can be resolved only by unity of faith, whatever may be said of abnormal means of salvation for individuals. C.'s concept of interreligion seems to me essentially unreal and only superficially valid in a purely human context.

The third part, "Present with the Peace of God," contains many moving passages which testify to C.'s passionate sincerity and zeal. For me, however, it is marred by some statements which are more emotional than theological. Thus, I think that the author says at once too little and too much when he affirms that "not in mere assertion, but by the mediation of the human presence and the personal equation, is the peace of God made known." It was certainly not a simple human presence which converted the Ephesians. Furthermore, I find C.'s remarks about the vocation of the Church ambiguous and debatable.

No Christian can speak for all who call themselves Christians, any more than any Muslim can speak for all who call themselves Muslims. The only valid unity which I can admit is Catholic unity—and from this standpoint there are certain things in C.'s book with which I cannot agree. I admire, however, his sincerity, devotion, and obvious charity. His book is suggestive and stimulating, and the issues he raises deserve a much more thorough
BOOK REVIEWS

discussion, especially on the theological level, than that which has been possible here.

Al-Hikma University, Baghdad, Iraq

R. J. McCARTHY, S.J.


These two books complement and enrich each other, the one weaving the thought deeply into the life, the other presenting the life and background as a systematic framework for the thought, of Berdyaev. Each is rich in bibliographical materials, though V.'s, as a more academic study, is more ample and varied in its citations, whether of Berdyaev's own writings or those about him. A general sketch of Russian history is a special feature of V.'s book and extremely useful to the student of Berdyaev's thought who may not be grounded in this complex area. Both books, as their titles indicate, accentuate the values of independence and freedom, but they each possess a special historical flavor, as V. was a member of the French Resistance, to whose perished members of the Vercours Underground he has dedicated his book, equally as L., in whose development of Berdyaev's profound personality there is illuminated at once the debt and the severance of his subject's mind in relation alike to the old and the new Russia.

There is, therefore, implicit and otherwise in these books and in the life of their subject one of the few genuinely profound philosophical strivings for the manifold dimension of a human freedom transcending not only the vapid aspirations of the modern world but even some truly lofty aims of many other philosophical schools. The broad character of these fascinating books is, then, clear as both biographical and interpretative accounts of a great personality, imperative works for students of human life and destiny.

These books, therefore, provide a depth of information and understanding on Berdyaev, a philosopher whose fulness of thought avoids the restriction of system and whose life generously embodies and expresses the inner sources of a vital thought. L., in twenty-one chapters partly based on close personal relationship, affords an insight into the development of his subject's spirit from his ancestral lineage alike Gallic and Russian, his youth and family, university and revolutions and wars, into the long Paris exile and the prophetic but sympathetic eminence of Clamart. These chapters
in their references and notes, as well as narrative and commentary, are the only available framework for the study of Berdyaev in English. The roots of his philosophy reach from Gnosticism, through German Idealism and Bohemian Mysticism and Eastern Orthodoxy in its Greek heritage, to Marxian and Existentialist modernism. Yet there is somehow a dynamic consistency in this strange amalgam. L. gives us one of the factors in this unitive tendency in his intimate structuring of a character which in all its manifold diversity never wavered in two major illuminations: freedom and fidelity. In the brevity of a review it is clearly impossible to attempt even an elementary exposition of the concepts suggested by these terms, save to say that they indicate an internal growth of independence penetrated with ever more profound awareness of divine and Christocentric paramountcy. One cannot avoid the possible feeling here that despite the numerous lines of impact on Berdyaev's living thought, the power of Soloviev's theandric theory was pre-eminent. It is here that after a prolonged dwelling on Berdyaev's life in L.'s book, V.'s more analytic account comes to our assistance. A concise and orderly six chapters furnish a broad vista of Berdyaev's drawing on the biblical anthropology and the Christian economy of redemption and history for the ultimate lineaments of his thought and theology. This yields perhaps the other factor of a unitive nature in so bewildering a multiplicity of sources: the scriptural and the traditional.

One may say, in summary, that the freedom is the philosophy, the fidelity is the theology, and the personality is the bond. These books in their compelling wealth not only will enable fuller critical treatment of their own theme, but remain as lasting introductions to one of the great minds of modern times.

_Pace College, New York, N.Y._

JOHN V. WALSH


The first three sections of this book attempt to review various dream theories from the early Greeks to psychoanalysis. Instead of critically evaluating these theories, Meseguer seems inclined to accept all of them, with an occasional warning that their excesses ought to be avoided.

From what he calls the "scientific" analysis of dreams (culled _in toto_ from a book written in 1936 by a Dr. Leonhard) he accepts the notion that the dream consists of memory images which obey "the laws of reappearance, persistence and association." From psychoanalysis he accepts Freud's dream mechanisms (symbolization, dramatization, condensation, etc.) to
explain how these memory images are turned into dreams. From Jung he takes the compensatory, prospective, and reductive function of dreams; but he fails to see that Jung considers the dream as an imaginative product which uses past impressions but must be interpreted from the story it tells, not according to the memory images discovered in free association.

M.'s criticism of these theories is rather casual. Apropos of Leonhard's work he says: "With a balanced and complete personal make-up [of the dream interpreter] and a sensible use of the law of dreams, it is possible to find deeper and richer meanings in dreams than those produced by academic 'scientific' analysis" (p. 86). Why scientific psychology should be blamed for one man's limitations is difficult to fathom. Of Freudian dream analysis he says that "the least satisfying aspect is its human psychology, its underlying view of man" (p. 86), though the earlier discussion gave no hint of such shortcomings. M. recognizes that to Jung "belongs the credit for giving depth psychology a religious direction" but suggests that "his work should be very carefully and constructively revised by Catholics" (p. 186). Not unreasonably, the reader might expect that the psychology of dreams will be revised, if not reformulated, in this book by a Catholic, that the "secret of dreams" will be revealed; if so, he is mistaken.

In the fourth section M. discusses cases and theories of telepathy and telepathic dreams in a similarly casual vein, only to state finally that Catholics do not admit that man can have a direct vision of past or future events, still less of free future acts.

The most original part of the book is the last section on "Dreams and Spiritual Direction." M. discusses dreams as a source of temptation and makes the important point that a man's dream actions may indicate the extent to which he has assimilated Christian morality. Rather pretentiously, he calls this "the law of impregnation of nature by spirit." According to M., dreams can and should be used in spiritual direction because they may indicate the state of a man's soul and guide his progress. To explain such directive functions, M. resorts to a dynamic "'ethic unconscious', the basic layer where the cognitive and instinctual demands which govern us are generated." This ethic unconscious "gives back in dreams all that was originally put into it by the conscious" (p. 193), though there are different levels of "oneiric consciousness": in light sleep there will be fairly coherent and rational dreams, and it is these dreams that can guide and reproach; in deep sleep, on the other hand, dreams are disconnected, nonsensical, or entirely lacking. The introduction of such contradictory notions as the "ethic unconscious" and "oneiric consciousness" contributes little to a genuine explanation of what goes on in dreams. It is possible, of course, that
the ambiguities and downright obscurities of the book are as much the result of the translation as of ambiguities in formulation.

This little book makes interesting reading, though it will be appreciated more by amateur than professional psychologists. But the amateur ought to be warned that the "laws" given so freely are at best provisional statements and that an all-embracing eclecticism does not make for scientific consistency.

_Loyola University, Chicago_  
_MAGDA B. ARNOLD_


Any bibliographic compilation can be judged only in the editorial frame of reference stated by the compiler. This list is intended to be a book-selection guide for small, especially beginning, Protestant theological seminaries in Africa, Asia, Latin America, and the South Pacific; and the project was financed by the Theological Education Fund of the International Missionary Council. The editorial purpose is excellently accomplished. Especially notable are the classified schedule which has been worked out as a framework for the bibliography, and the wide selection of books in English in the biblical divisions. Of 5472 titles listed, 1952 are in the general category, Bible. The great majority of books are in English, although English language is not a criterion for inclusion by any means. Catholic authors are included, but one can hardly say that Catholic scholarship is well represented in areas where a Protestant seminary should have Catholic materials. Some periodicals, especially the specialists' journals, are listed in particular areas; a general list would have been a help. Some few titles are briefly annotated, the compiler sometimes stating an evaluation, sometimes quoting one. Important information about new editions or about new translations of certain titles is given. Checking these infrequent annotations makes one wish that a second edition would include many more annotations, even if the editor has to sacrifice the many contents notes now included. The criterion of scholarship is maintained: the compiler has avoided both the devotional type of material so frequent in Catholic book lists and the hortatory type which often burdens Protestant lists. Out-of-print and even rare books are included, even though the primary purpose was to make this a purchasing guide. The book is multilithed from typescript but is a fine product of this medium.

This bibliography is recommended for all academic libraries. Catholic librarians will find it useful for checking their holdings in biblical studies;
excellent for a guide to materials in Protestant doctrine and history; useful to some extent for missiology, history, and for basic texts in non-Christian religions. Finally, a small but pertinent suggestion: the title is apt to be misleading, since a great portion of the titles listed are not theological; a second edition should call this a list of books in religion.

St. Peter's College, N.J.  
EDMOND F. X. IVERS, S.J.


This volume, as the previous volumes in the series, presents three interesting studies from the Cahiers Laënnec which are related to the field of medical ethics: contraception, alcoholism, and metapsychic phenomena. Each of these subjects is recognized as involving psychosomatic elements, and each author attempts to evaluate the ratio and significance of the psychic component of his subject. The first study, by Mertens de Wilmars, deals with the important question of the deleterious psychiatric impact of positive contraception on the marriage partners, and particularly upon the wife. Dr. de Wilmars describes maternity as the somatic and psychic maturation of the married woman, and describes contraception as incompatible with the oblative, exclusive, and sincere qualities of marital love. The psychic trauma resulting from positive contraception is scientifically set forth, and experimental evidence is offered to illustrate the neurotic patterns of homosexuality, perversion, and prostitution which can result. The psychic impact of family limitation by sterilization and abortion is reviewed and documented, as well as the dangers inherent in an inadequate approach to periodic continence.

In the second study Dr. Henri Duchene discusses modern psychiatric perspectives regarding alcoholism. Perhaps the approach to the problem is a bit too heavily psychiatric in that pharmacologic therapies (such as antabuse) are mentioned mainly in terms of their limitations, and whatever good they accomplish is attributed to their psychiatric overtones. Moreover, while allowing that free will is operative in some cases of alcoholism, the strictly psychiatric approach (positively excluding any moral overtones) is advocated because D. considers alcoholism as "a pathological mode of behavior to the extent to which it escapes the control of the patient's will, and is therefore outside the moral domain" (p. 109). It is perhaps this remark that occasions a paragraph on the objective morality of the sins of alcoholism in the editor's foreword. Even forms of psychotherapy other
than analysis are prejudicially evaluated. One of D.'s practical conclusions is that the alcoholic, as having a neurotic personality, would be best treated in a general hospital, but in an area where psychiatry would be a governing rather than an ancillary specialty.

The third study (author's identity not apparent) is an interesting but less satisfying investigation into such metapsychic phenomena as the supposed extraterrestrial communications of spiritualistic media, table rappings, mundane prophecy, telepathy, etc. Possible explanations of such phenomena are investigated, and the phenomena are contrasted with authentic Christian miracles. The esoteric nature of the subject matter itself necessarily leaves a brief treatment of its many ramifications somewhat unsatisfying.

Georgetown University Medical School

THOMAS J. O'DONNELL, S.J.


The "elements of Christian philosophy" are the key notions essential to the proper understanding of the philosophy of St. Thomas. They are, first, the relation of philosophy to theology, and secondly, the Thomistic notion of being—that which is—and the impact of this notion on such philosophical ideas as God, substance, efficient causality, finite being, man, intellect, and will.

Theology is not confined to the consideration of actually revealed truths. Under its object fall also the "revealable," those naturally knowable truths which are nonetheless capable of revelation, since they have a bearing on man's supernatural end. The theologian, therefore, makes use of the results of the natural sciences, but he "judges" and orders them in the light of the principles known by faith which govern his own science. From this fact it follows that Christian philosophy is an instrument used by the theologian in his study of the "revealable." Consequently, although it is carried on by natural reason, and although the principles of its demonstration are truly philosophical, the order of its demonstrations is theological. It does not proceed from the essences of finite things to a knowledge of God. Rather, it begins with God and considers finite things in their relation to Him. To be authentically Thomistic, therefore, philosophy must begin with the problem of God's existence and nature, and conduct its subsequent investigation of the nature of created being and of man in the light of the truths acquired from its study of the divinity. To proceed in any other order is to miss the
essential connection between its elements, on which the intrinsic intelligibility of the system depends.

The primacy of esse, discovered with the aid of revelation, and the theological order of its development are the dual foundation of the whole Thomistic edifice. For it was St. Thomas the theologian, meditating on the text of Exodus, "I am who am," who first realized the significance of esse as the ultimate constituent of the real. Because of this discovery he was able to transform philosophical proofs for the existence of God drawn from a number of different philosophies and incorporate them into an existential natural theology uniquely his own. It enabled him also to reinterpret the philosophy of Aristotle in the light of the existential act in such wise that Aristotle's theory of causality opened out naturally into the doctrines of the divine creation and conservation of finite being, and Aristotle's psychology could explain the substantial unity of man without endangering the immortality of the human soul.

These ideas are quite familiar to the readers of Gilson's previous books, particularly The Christian Philosophy of St. Thomas Aquinas. Indeed, the present volume is, to a large extent, a repetition of that earlier work in the simpler form suited to the instruction of undergraduate students. Consequently, the historians of philosophy who are unwilling to accept the Gilsonian interpretation of St. Thomas' philosophy will have difficulty in accepting the central theses of the present book. Likewise, modern Thomists, such as James Collins, who have already objected to the use of the theological order of development in contemporary Thomism, will have some reserves concerning its use as an introductory text for today's undergraduates. In any case, Gilson's ordering of the main elements of the Thomistic synthesis will not make for ease of presentation in classes whose students have had no previous acquaintance with philosophy, and there is reason to question whether a volume whose emphasis falls so heavily on the problems of the medieval philosopher and theologian will readily convince the undergraduate of the contemporary relevance of Thomism.

As a summary of Gilson's interpretation of the philosophy of St. Thomas, however, the present book is truly admirable. Its presentation is clear and cogent. Without question it is a valuable contribution to contemporary Thomistic literature.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y. 

GERALD A. MCCOOL, S.J.


If proof is still needed of the fruitfulness of Marcel's approach to phi-
losophy, or of its capacity to provide conceptual tools of extraordinary power and refinement for rethinking the data of Christian revelation, this latest book of the philosopher's most distinguished disciple should supply it. Writing on the mystery of death, T. has supplied us not only with a compelling philosophy of life but also with such insight into revealed truths as cannot fail to renew enthusiasm and gratitude in the receivers of Christ's message.

The general theme of the book is one of personal growth—the passage of man from the level of existence (community), where the relations that define him are imposed from without, to the level of being (communion), where they are ones he has freely chosen. The point of passage is thus a choice for communion that reintegrates man on a higher level of participation in reality than the one which he enjoyed before, but which the development of objective knowledge and self-consciousness, by destroying its immediacy and integrity, had finally ruptured. Having outgrown the previous stage of innocence, he cannot re-enter it; nor can he enter the realm of responsible, personal life except freely. Failure, therefore, to choose communion is a refusal to grow and leaves man stymied in a world of fragments.

This, of course, is the scheme used by T. in his *De l'existence à l'être* to synthesize Marcel's philosophy. But, although that synthesis provides evidence for an afterlife (in that personal communion involves a participation in being that transcends the level of biological life, alone touched by death), still it does not account for the fact of death. In order, therefore, to make death meaningful, T. resorts to a fruitful joining of Marcel's thought with that of Teilhard de Chardin. In the light of the latter, the drama of personal growth from existence to being is given a cosmic setting and becomes part of the evolutionary process in which death also has its place. But the universal expenditure of material energy in favor of progressive interiorization, which is the law of evolution and which, in the case of man, results in his death, has also in his case produced a value that is indestructible, namely, his person. For the person, therefore, death is simply a rupture analogous to that between existence and being and providing, as there, the possibility for a higher synthesis, for which man's biological life has simply been the preparation. This synthesis will be a life of total communion in which matter has been wholly interiorized but which, once again, man must freely choose—hence, the idea of final option as the inner face of the fact of death.

Having gone this far with philosophy, T. devotes the last part of his work
to an examination of revelation in the light of this hypothesis. The result is a synthesis of fascinating comprehension. It is to be hoped that the work of this extraordinary teacher will soon be made available to English readers.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y.  
ROBERT O. JOHANN, S.J.


Although it be true that a book such as this will be appreciated only with difficulty by philosophers and theologians in America, it is still of the utmost importance that they make the effort to read and understand it. The phenomenon of serious Catholic intellectuals flirting with Marxism is virtually unknown among us, and we feel no need to take seriously the few who incline in that direction. In France and other European countries, however, Marxism does exercise a certain hypnosis on Catholic thinkers, as manifested in the movement of “Christian progressivism” and in the unfortunate example of so many among those who sought to evangelize the “masses” by becoming “priest-workers.” The danger among Americans is that they will fail to appreciate the sincerity which prompts such a sympathy.

The difficulties involved in both these positions have long been simply incomprehensible to Americans. In a country where the laborer is frequently better off materially than the college professor, it is not easy to see a spiritual affinity between “labor” and “poverty.” Nor, where the taxicab driver is willing to work sixteen hours a day to send his seven children through college, without wasting his time in bitterness against the “capitalists” who have made his lot so hard, are we likely to see a mystic significance in either labor or poverty.

That serious injustices (both here and abroad) do exist, no serious thinker will deny, and it is to be hoped that our philosophers and theologians are not so absorbed in “eternal truths” (a euphemism for abstractions) that they fail to be concerned with redressing these injustices. It is not to be expected, however, that they will find a solution in endowing the “proletariat” with some sort of collective personality and then attributing to it some “salvific mission” whose “immanent philosophy” will be Marxism. For this very reason it may come as something of a shock to American Catholic intellectuals that such eminent French Catholic scholars as the late Emmanuel Mounier, Jean Lacroix, and Jacques Maritain have been in
this book gently called to task for their attempts to right wrongs by attributing to the philosophy (or mysticism) of Communism a historical role in the *hic et nunc* situation.

With admirable charity, understanding, and sympathy, Fr. Fessard traces the steps whereby philosophers and theologians, who know only the categories of the "real" or the "rational," can deceive themselves when it comes to making a "historical" judgment. He excuses them by implying that their training simply did not equip them to deal with the historical—particularly with the historical significance of the present moment. Where the judgment concerns the significance of the proletariat (the very concept of which is a Marxist creation) for the working out of man's historical destiny, the error is compounded by the fact that the authors of it are but little aware of either the Hegelian or the Marxist dialectics of history. It is thus possible for them to see an acceptable Christian significance in a dialectic which is essentially atheistic and opposed to what might be called a Christian sense of history.

The involved criticism through which F. takes us fills two volumes of very closely packed reasoning which will scarcely be adequately grasped under the categories of the "real" and the "rational." Thus, in the first volume, two thirds of which consists of articles formerly published, the author seeks to establish the dialectical method which he will employ in the second volume. Those who know F.'s work will recognize his stress upon the Hegelian dialectics of the master and slave and of man and woman as well as the Pauline dialectic of the Jew and the pagan, which the author has employed so tellingly elsewhere. It is in the light of the last that he examines Communism and Nazism in their opposition to each other and in their common opposition to Christianity. The conclusion of this examination is that a reconciliation of Communism and Christianity is just as impossible as a reconciliation between Nazism and Christianity.

The second volume is devoted to a detailed examination of "Christian progressivism" and of the position taken by those "priest-workers" in France who refused to submit to the ecclesiastical condemnation of the movement. Common to both is the notion that the "proletariat" is the bearer of a historical salvific mission, needing only to be purged of the atheistic connotations which Communism has given it in order to assume its role in the history of human salvation in the economic and political orders. The theme of F.'s refutation of this position is that only an ignorance of the true sense of history could make one blind to the essential connection between the concept of the proletariat as a historically destined class and the class struggle as the mainspring in the Marxist dialectic of history.
Atheism is not an accidental and temporary phenomenon connected with this theory; it is essential to it. The question is not whether Communists can become Christians but whether Communism can be Christianized. The latter F. emphatically denies, and he does so in the name of that very "sense of history" which others invoke in their defense of Marxism.

To philosophers and theologians the concrete issues discussed in this book are of less ultimate importance than are the principles governing the whole discussion. It is the author's contention that the philosopher and—perhaps more significantly—the theologian must be concerned with the temporal, and thus with the political, order. It is his further contention that a failure to cope with the historical (as in the two movements he analyzes at such great length) too often has its roots in a training which rests too exclusively on the "contemplation" of eternal truths. Communist theory is irreconcilable with the eternal truths on which Christianity takes its stand, but only by genuinely coming to terms with the historical can one see this clearly. It is not enough to dislike Communism or to see in it a threat to the values we live by; one must see its failure to be precisely what it claims to be, the philosophy which correctly interprets the course of history. Only a philosophy and theology which is truly concrete and historical can do this. Small wonder, then, the author tells us, that those whose training is exclusively Scholastic are unequipped for the task. The phenomena discoverable on the French scene may not be of great interest to thinkers in other lands; the lesson to be learned from them, however, must burn itself deeply into the consciousness of all. We need not—indeed we must not—be unsympathetic with Marxist analyses of social injustice; but we must be clear as to why the Communist solution is no solution at all: it fails in its most important claim, that of being in tune with history.

Fordham University  
QUENTIN LAUER, S.J.


"It is easier, of course, to provide a radical manifesto than it is to plan what Mounier called 'the patient transformation of everyday life.' But the manifesto is not likely to do justice to the complexities of either the existential situation or the speculative problem itself" (p. 194). This quotation from Fr. Donohue's contribution to Jesuit Studies may be taken as a brief justification for the book itself and might well be taken to heart by several current writers on education in Catholic periodicals. The relationship of
work and education lends itself to the writers of manifestoes. D. has produced a quietly searching meditation on the work of several writers of manifestoes on this subject: Dewey, Marx, Babbitt, Adler, and Hutchins. As his scholarly examination touches each one, the extreme character of the position is gently but unmistakably revealed and the impatience of the proponent sympathetically explained in terms of his personal and ideological background. But D. is not satisfied to point out the problems in the polar positions of work as an absolute value and work as a mere necessity to provide leisure. He proposes a synthesis under the guiding light of Christian humanism, in which work becomes a positive force in the educative development of the total person.

This book is a genuine contribution to a problem in educational theory which is too often ignored. Emphasis on intellectual development in education is all to the good, but it may well lead to mere bookishness if the intellectual element in productive endeavor is neglected and if the complex of intellectual and other virtues which is needed to develop the finest characteristics of the ideal workman is valued at less than its true importance. There may be less to fear in these troubled times from a failure of nerve than from a failure to develop the multiple products of the stern habits of demanding craftsmanship.

No attempt has been made in this book to develop a thorough theology of work, but references to such attempts are supplied in abundance. The author's own attempt is to look on the problem in the general light of the Christian view, emphasizing the openness of that view to the desirable elements in other views and the synthesizing power which the Christian outlook provides.

Too cautious for the seeker of easy solutions, too sympathetic to opposing views for the polemicist, too literate for the technician, this book may have a more limited distribution than it deserves; but it brings the refreshing breath of justice and charity into an area of discussion where they are too often absent. Sometimes, however, the reader may feel that D. is too preoccupied with turns of phrase and polished paragraphs, thus blurring a little the steady progress of his thought.

D.'s book deserves a place in every college library and in the study of every thoughtful student of both education and contemporary thought.

*Saint Louis University*  
CARL A. HANGARTNER, S.J.

If this is the dawn of a new theological era, as Fr. Lynch and others have suggested, its dominant trait would seem to be the amendment of all optimistic readings of the maxim, "Grace perfects nature." The movement of history contributes its own insights into the nature of man, and one is therefore not surprised that our age, since the two wars, has been marked by a sense of the tragic. Next year will see the publication in English of Karl Rahner's *Zur Theologie des Todes*, along with an essay on martyrdom, by Herder and Herder (for another English version of the essay on death, see the review [Dec., 1960] of Caponigri, *Modern Catholic Thinkers*; *Morte ed immortalità* by M. F. Sciacca and *Je ne meurs pas* by R. Troisfontaines (see review above) have recently appeared.

To say that a theology of death illuminates this work is not to demean its professed subject, the literary imagination. The literary imagination is the human imagination articulate. This imagination, L. stresses, is drawn to the finite and concrete as well as to the unlimited and universal. There is a tension between these two attractions which may be resolved artificially by eliminating or evading one of them or by inorganically juxtaposing them; unfortunately for the tacticians of evasion and deletion, these are not a real resolution, since the only way to the infinite universal insight is through the limited concrete. The two must be fused in a real interpenetration. Metaphysically, L. is talking about the analogy of being, about the unity which contains its multiplicity. In a more significant sense, he is talking about incarnation and redemption and about man's structure: about the God-man and that particular hill on that particular day when that particular man died and drew all things unto Himself, because He is the exemplary cause of all things. Finally, L. is talking about that burial in the finite, dense waters of baptism and that rebirth into infinite life. Like St. Paul, man must die daily, must pass through the finite into the infinite. The dramatic tragedy is the imaging-out in gesture, chant, and mime of man's inexorable movement towards this dying.

L.'s book has been so thoroughly discussed and so widely applauded that no further summary seems necessary; and the few critical comments that follow are in their way another tribute to this exciting, firmly grounded Christian esthetic. Like his master, L. approaches literature through the drama, and, again like Aristotle, he does not have much to offer on the lyric. With the Chicago critics he asserts that action "is the soul of the literary imagination," and he quotes pejoratively Gertrude Stein's gnomes to the effect that poetry is based on the noun. Yet studies such as Josephine Miles's *Eras and Modes* suggest that even though different periods produce a predominantly substantive or a predominantly predicative poetry, there
is little apparent correlation between one or the other and poetic excellence. Similarly, Norman MacLean's "From Action to Image" cannot prove, so to speak, that the breakdown of the conjugation was also a declension. One goes along willingly with the assumption that action is the soul of the drama; but the lyric is primarily substantive and is always characterized by metered language: the latter need not be present in the drama, as the ease with which L. moves back and forth between tragedy in verse and tragedy in prose may serve to indicate.

It is here that I am confused by L.'s praise for Scotus. This entire book is founded on the analogy of proportionality, a notion which must be rooted in the real distinction between essence and existence—which Scotus denied. Aristotle may be the schoolmaster of playwrights; Scotus is the patron of lyric poets. Besides the composite of matter and form or images and ideas (or whatever vocabulary we prefer), in the lyric we have also the all-pervading meters which here function like Scotus' modes. They are, as his critics would say, the metaphysical glue that knits the poem together.

To two other points one would like to see L. give precision: his remarks on poetry and belief tend to make this issue a pseudo problem. One would have preferred—to mention two students of this problem who have written from our theological perspective—that sympathetic grasp Walter Ong showed in his English Institute essay or William Rooney in his Catholic University dissertation. It is not quite enough to dismiss this most controverted question as a hang-over from the daze of dissociation. Second, there are frequent harsh references to Keats that jar in the context of so many fine critical appraisals of playwrights and novelists. We ought to be able to distinguish between the "Romantic" esthetic, which was born of resentful and rebellious journalists and hacks, and the great Romantic poets. I can think of no artist who better illustrates L.'s analogical imagination in action or whose writings are more patient of the exegetical approach this book advocates than Keats. We would profit much by L.'s examination of *Hyperion* and *Lamia* as well as of the great odes.

*St. Xavier College, Chicago, Ill.*

JUSTUS GEORGE LAWLER
SHORTER NOTICES

GUIDE TO THE BIBLE 1: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY OF HOLY SCRIPTURE. Published under the direction of A. Robert and A. Tricot; translated from the third French edition by Edward P. Arbez, S.S., and Martin R. P. McGuire. 2nd ed.; Tournai–New York: Desclée, 1960. Pp. xxvi + 812. $8.00. The first edition of the Guide to the Bible (1951; reviewed by M. J. Dahood, THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 14 [1953] 91–92; see also 16 [1955] 660–61) was a translation of the second French edition (1948; reviewed by D. J. Saunders, THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 10 [1949] 140), but greatly enriched by useful footnotes and abundant references to further bibliographical material in many languages. The same competent translators have now prepared a new edition based on the French “troisième édition ‘refondue’” (1954). Again the translators have expanded it with much useful material, so that Vol. 1 has grown by almost three hundred pages. Though this work suffers in the comparison which one is prone to make of it with the new two-volumed Introduction à la Bible (ed. by A. Robert and A. Feuillet; see THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 20 [1959] 108–10; 21 [1960] 283–85), it is nevertheless a very useful collection of studies on a less specialized level, and even excellent in certain parts. Particularly to be recommended is chap. 1 on “Inspiration” by P. Benoit (pp. 9–52), which replaces the nineteen-page treatment of the earlier edition and which is written by an exegete with wide experience who has studied this subject extensively and coped with the modern problems. Also to be recommended are the new sections on the Sapiential Books (by A. Robert), the Prophetic Books (by A. Gelin), and “The Bible and Theology” (by P. Henry). But the English edition has some new features, prepared by Arbez, which are lacking in the French. The most significant of these is his “Analysis of the Books of the Pentateuch,” a section which was formerly quite scanty. There is also a brief sketch of the Dead Sea Scrolls. There is no doubt that this volume will achieve its goal as “an indispensable help and guide not only for seminarians but also for the teachers of religion in our secondary schools and colleges, for college and university students, and for the educated Catholic laity in general.” Even scholars will benefit from the abundant references to Israeli writings, otherwise often omitted.

Woodstock College

Joseph A. Fitzmyer, S.J.

INTRODUCTION TO THE OLD TESTAMENT. By Frederick L. Moriarty, S.J. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1960. Pp. xi + 253. $4.25. This work is the first in a new series called Impact Books, the purpose of which is to establish con-
tact between Catholics and non-Catholics on questions of common concern in biblical studies, theology, and philosophy. Noting that “... history is never so interesting as when it takes the form of historical biography,” M. gives the educated nonspecialist a taste of modern biblical scholarship, a glimpse of salvation history, and an introduction to the OT by delineating fifteen heroic figures that span two thousand years of Israel’s unique historical experience. Abraham and Moses trace the early history and point up its theological significance. Joshua takes us through the conquest. In Saul and David we see the early kingdom. In the divided monarchy we hear the prophets Elijah and Amos speaking to the north, Isaiah and Jeremiah to the south. Ezekiel takes us through the captivity. With Second Isaiah and Nehemiah we enter the postexilic period, while Job, Qoheleth, and Daniel bring us down to Maccabean times. To censure the brief treatment given certain historical, archeological, and exegetical problems would be to misunderstand the author’s purpose. The book is meant for the intelligent, interested, but uninformed reader. M. has produced a thoroughly readable history that could well be recommended for outside reading in college theology courses as a clear introduction to the literature, the figures, and the religious thought of the OT. In addition to frequent passages from Scripture where the great heroes speak for themselves, M. has included a brief bibliography of biblical studies published in English within the past five years.

Woodstock College

James A. O’Donnell, S.J.

THE BIBLE IN THE LIGHT OF MODERN SCIENCE. By Bertram Hessler. Translated by Sylvester Sailer. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1960. Pp. xiii + 87. $1.75. The results of contemporary biblical scholarship, stimulated in Catholic circles by the Divino afflante of Pius XII, are gradually filtering through to the general public. A contribution to the process is made by this slender volume. After reviewing the strained relations between natural science and the Bible inaugurated by the unfortunate mishandling of the Galileo case, H. expresses optimism concerning the relaxations of tensions that need never have accumulated. To illustrate the absence of real opposition between biblical prehistory and scientific prehistory, he compares the biblical story of the origin of the world and of man with the findings of modern science. He concludes that no incongruity between the two accounts is possible, owing to the entirely different planes on which the beginnings are viewed. The literary character of the early chapters of Genesis is well set forth, with emphasis on the sacred writer’s attempts at dramatization. No great difficulty is encountered regarding the origin of the first man; but the derivation of Eve from Adam is found to be as perplexing a problem.
as ever. The ingenious proposals put forward in recent years are examined, but none is judged satisfactory. Respectful attention to declarations of the magisterium is observed throughout the book. The translator seems to have experienced some trouble in rendering the original German into idiomatic English, and his efforts along this line are not always successful. Lengthy paragraphs which are apparently congenial to German taste have not been broken down into the shorter units favored by the literary palates of American and English readers.

St. Mary's College, Kansas

Cyril Vollert, S.J.

Schebiit (Vom Sabbatjahr): Die Mischna 1/5. Text, translation, and notes by Dietrich Correns. Berlin: Töpelmann, 1960. Pp. vii + 181. The Mishnah, which is the oldest compilation of Jewish oral law, was edited by Rabbi Judah the Patriarch towards the end of the second century of the Christian era. Ever since its completion it has been diligently studied and minutely analyzed and explained, first by the Amoraim of Palestine and Babylonia and afterwards by Jewish codifiers and expositors virtually up to the present day. Yet, although there has recently been published, by Prof. Saul Lieberman of the Jewish Theological Seminary of America, the first part of a systematic critical edition of the Tosephta, a contemporary collection of tannaitic teachings, there exists as yet nothing comparable, in completed form, of the more authoritative Mishnah. The beginning of an attempt to supply this lack was made by Prof. O. Holtzmann of Giessen, who in the year 1912 published his edition of the tractate of Berakoth, dealing with prayers. Since then, other tractates have appeared, following the methods employed in the initial volume. The current one by Dr. Correns is the twenty-eighth in the series. The importance of a critical edition of a tractate of the Mishnah like that of Schebiit, which deals with the rules and regulations applying to the Sabbatical year, and an up-to-date, scientific commentary thereon, lies in the fact that it contains numerous botanical terms as well as place names still in need of identification. C. seems to have fulfilled this task superbly. He shows complete mastery of his subject as well as thorough familiarity with the pertinent literature up to the year of the publication of his contribution. The weakest part of an otherwise excellent monograph is the Introduction, in which an attempt is made to trace the history and development of the institution of the Sabbatical year, which was also a year of the remission of debts, from its earliest beginnings. It is weak because it is based on conjecture rather than demonstrable facts, and because it accepts as gospel truth the Wellhausen documentary hypothesis, which has lately been discredited by the findings of archeology and repudi-
ated by historians of the Jewish religion, like Ezekiel Kaufman, after having been refuted by specialists in rabinics of the calibre of a David Hoffmann.

Johns Hopkins University

Samuel Rosenblatt

**WAITING FOR CHRIST.** By Ronald Knox and Ronald Cox. New York: Sheed & Ward, 1960. Pp. 282. $3.50. C. is doubtless familiar with Alexander Pope's dictum: "Be not the first by whom the new are tried/ Nor yet the last to lay the old aside" (Essay on Criticism 1, 335). In Waiting for Christ he has extravagantly honored the first part of the admonition: the exegesis practiced here is anything but **avant-garde.** One of the book's exegetical presuppositions that is notoriously open to challenge as being dated is the notion that the image of a personal Messiah loomed very large and in clear outline in Jewish thinking. C.'s work is tightly committed to this assumption. The book is organized according to a plan which draws together an **OT** text and a corresponding text from the **NT.** The latter ostensibly exhibits the Messianic fulfilment of the former. (The texts are quoted from the Knox translation of the Bible. This represents K.'s posthumous contribution to the book. The choosing, marshaling, and exegesis of the texts has been done by C.) It is, however, problematical whether all the **OT** references that are here christened as outrightly Messianic are truly so; cf., among others, Gn 22:18; 49:10–12; Mi 5:2. Before beginning the chase down through the **OT** in quest of Messianic allusions, it is salutary to keep in mind Bonsirven's sound estimate of the situation: "La doctrine juive, dans ses vues messianiques, met l'accent non sur la personne du Messie, mais sur la restauration de la nation élu... les docteurs découvriront beaucoup plus de références à la Loi et à Israël qu'au Messie" (DBS 4, 1232). As to C.'s style, here it is easier to generate enthusiasm. He commands an admirable clarity of expression which he employs with felicitous result. It is singularly qualified to share the page with K.'s luminous prose.

Darlington Seminary, Ramsey, N.J.

James C. Turro

article on the Synoptics and Mollat’s on St. John are especially valuable. Unfortunately, the translation is very imperfect. While free from egregious errors, it frequently distorts or obscures the original meaning. The same carelessness carries over into the editorial features of the work: captions have been misplaced, important paragraphs omitted without apparent reason, Scripture citations given without reference to chapter and verse, footnotes erroneously numbered, proper names and foreign titles misspelled. But in spite of these defects the book will be useful to many readers who do not have access to the French original.

Woodstock College

Avery Dulles, S.J.

Le Mystère de Dieu. By Ch.-V. Héris, O.P. 2nd ed.; Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 299. H., professor of dogmatic theology for thirty years at Le Saulchoir, is well known not only for his French translations of parts of the Summa, but also for his beautiful volumes of meditations in which he unites the deepest theological thought with a lucid style and warm devotion. The present volume, first published in 1944, even more than his other writings of the same nature (Le mystère du Christ [1927]; L’Eglise du Christ [1930]; Le mystère de l’Eucharistie, etc.), is focused on the mystery of divine love as it is manifested and brought close to us through and in the Incarnation. His approach is eminently—one could even say existentially—Christological: he wishes to consider not only what Christ teaches of God, but mainly the Person of Jesus Christ in His humanity as a real ontological revelation of the Father (pp. 14 and 35 ff.). It is a pity that this insight is not more explicitly emphasized all through the book, which under the special aspect of love covers the whole field of our dogmatic theology. One God (chap. 3), Trinity (chap. 4), creation (chap. 5), sanctification (chap. 6), Christology (chaps. 7–9), Holy Spirit (chap. 10)—it seems that chapters 6, 10, and 11, on the theological virtues, could have been better correlated—eschatology (chap. 12), and finally Mariology (chap. 13): a real summula of divine love. In his theological thought H. follows the great Dominican tradition: contemplata tradere. One does not know which to enjoy more in his writing: the lucid clarity of the doctrine or the inspiring beauty of the expression. Even if one does not agree in every point with his theological views (as, for instance, I certainly do not in regard to the primary motive of the Incarnation), one has still to admire his presentation. Indeed, it would be highly desirable that such writings of solid theological foundation should replace on the bookshelves of our clergy and even of our intelligent Catholic families the devotional literature of more emotional appeal.

University of Notre Dame

Charles H. Henkey
THE DIVINE INDWELLING AND DISTINCT RELATIONS TO THE INDWELLING PERSONS IN MODERN THEOLOGICAL DISCUSSION. By Peter F. Chirico, S.S. Rome: Gregorian Univ., 1960. Pp. 143. In this doctoral dissertation modern studies of European and North American theologians on the relation between created and uncreated grace are discussed and criticized. As a conclusion C. proposes a tentative theory of his own which is reducible to the “sicut cognitum in cognoscente et amatum in amante” of St. Thomas and developed later by John of St. Thomas. The student will find the book of help as an introduction to the problem, but the professional theologian will find little new in it. There are a few lapsus calami, as the statement that the soul “is created grace” (n. 137, author’s emphasis) and that “efficient causality . . . accounts for all the reality (n. 274) of de la Taille’s actuation. Were this so, how would the theory be referable to the hypostatic union and to a relation on the part of the humanity of Christ to just one divine Person? Something Trinitarian is required for the supernatural presence of God, because this presence (on the creature’s side) is specifically different from God’s natural presence, a reason overlooked by the author (n. 279 and note 6). Finally, the dilemma proposed in n. 253 is not at all a dilemma. One simply denies that the Trinitarian aspect of created grace comes from divine efficient causality. It cannot be demonstrated that the “omnia opera ad extra sunt communia,” the derived conclusion from Florence’s “omniaque in divinis sunt unum,” etc., holds good for anything except divine efficient causality. The book offers a bibliography of some sixty authors. It is recommended for seminarians.

St. Mary’s College, Kansas

Malachi J. Donnelly, S.J.

MARIE, MÈRE DU SEIGNEUR: MÉDITATIONS THÉOLOGIQUES. By Karl Rahner, S.J. Translated by Roger Tandonnet. Paris: Editions de l’Orante. Pp. 132. This French translation makes available to many who could not read the original German this useful Mariology, the characteristic tendency of which is to underline the continuity of Mary’s vocation with that of the common faithful: “Mary is the concrete realization of the perfect Christian” (p. 49). The finest passages are those on grace. Evidently sensitive to Protestant critiques of the Semi-Pelagian form in which Catholic moral teaching is often cast, R. presents the virginal motherhood as the supreme exemplification of the great Pauline and Augustinian doctrine of the primacy and gratuity of God’s action in us (pp. 85 ff.). At the same time he points out that, precisely because our acts have truly been given to us, they retain all the freedom and responsibility needed to satisfy existentialist demands for dialogue and decision (pp. 72 f.). The unrelenting effort to
celebrate in Mary "man in general" (p. 41) makes the book fall perhaps a little short of due attention to what is distinctive of Mary's grandeur, as R. himself seems uneasily aware (pp. 67 f.). Her mediation is reduced to that which all the saints exercise by prayer (pp. 118 ff.), with only this distinction, that it perpetuates the fiat of Nazareth (p. 124). The book will be most valuable to those who are repelled by Catholic devotion to Mary, and to those who are impelled by sentimental enthusiasm to falsify it. It is perhaps less suited to furnish doctrinal nourishment to souls already captivated by an authentic love of the Blessed Mother.

University of Notre Dame

Edward D. O'Connor, C.S.C.

Envoyés du Père: Mission et apostolité. By L. M. Dewailly, O.P. Paris: Editions de l'Orante, 1960. Pp. 158. D. gathers together three essays or studies: mission as the work of God; the divine mission in the Person of Christ and in the apostolic Church; a documented research into the meanings of the word "apostolicity." Generally missions are thought of in terms of the catholicity of the Church. D. does not deny that missions realize the catholic nature of the Church. His concern is that by a vague use of the words "apostle" and "apostolic" there is danger of losing the essential concept which underlies these words: the bond with the Son sent, who in turn sends the apostles. To re-emphasize this necessary bond, D. offers a valuable etymological and historical study of mission. He fears the confusion of method with the essential nature of mission, and there is some justification for his fear. He sifts out and analyzes the various meanings which have been given to the term "apostolic." But the source of all is the sending of the Son by the Father and the sending of the Holy Spirit by the Father and the Son. Apostolicity looks to the source and content of the mission. While D. reminds us that the mission of the Church is related to the traditional notes of the Church, his study is aimed at calling one back to a deeper realization of the primary significance of apostolicity. Scripture is used profusely and the text is substantially documented. A short bibliography is offered. This is a solid piece of writing from which those engaged in the missionary life of the Church and those who write about it may derive some sharp insights.

Jesuit Missions, N.Y.

Edward L. Murphy, S.J.

organized, each being developed through the baptismal liturgy and through judicious use of patristic catechetical commentary on the sacrament and its rites. The richest of the three sections, from the viewpoint of the exploitation of insufficiently known aspects of the theology of baptism, is the first, "Sacrament of Faith," with its four subdivisions: baptism as profession of faith, as commitment of faith, as illumination, and as aggregation to the community of believers. The most successful section, however, from the viewpoint of the book's immediate purpose, is the second, "Death and Resurrection," with its two chapters, "Death to Sin" and "New Life." In the second of these two chapters, under a rubric at first sight unpromising because so much has been written about it and so many unexamined generalities have become associated with it, a stimulating picture is drawn of the new life in Christ and its characteristics. The least satisfactory section is the third, "Baptism and the Holy Spirit," where the thorny question of the relation of baptism to confirmation overshadows the four chapters, even where it is not explicitly raised. The difficulty here, however, is not immediately in the realm of "spirituality," but in its necessary presupposition, the theology of confirmation. The blame for the unsatisfactoriness (which, however, ought not be exaggerated) of these chapters cannot justly be laid at C.'s door: he has, in other writings, done as much as most present-day historians and theologians to try to clear away the obscurity concerning confirmation.

Woodstock College

M. J. O'Connell, S.J.

ENTRE DANS LA JOIE: CATÉCHÈSES SUR L'AU-DELÀ. By M. A. Genevois, O.P. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 268. 9 fr. Though the subtitle might suggest otherwise, this is not a work in the area of modern catechetics. Thinking rather of the catecheses which the early Church continued to give the faithful after baptism, the author uses the word here in much the same sense to designate what he styles his "literary genre": doctrinal instruction for adult Catholics to deepen their grasp of the faith—something midway between the catechism and scientific theology, a vulgarisation théologique. The general subject of the present instructions, originally given in lecture form, is the world to come. Though the customary eschatological themes have been treated in the ten chapters and introduction, the author has not intended a well-integrated work on "The Last Things"; he has, moreover, approached the entire subject from the particularized viewpoint that God is Love. The presentation of each topic is structured by the author's reply to two questions: (1) What precisely does the Church say on this point? (2) What does the Church mean by these technical statements? G. has
achieved the aim of his "literary form" with marked success; on his engag­ingly popularized presentation of the usual theological loci he has left the stamp of the adept professional, sensitive both to the significance of recent trends in eschatology and to their organic relationship with the legitimate gains of the past. Especially commendable in this regard are the author's treatments of purgatory, hell, resurrection of the body, and the number of the elect (where the pessimistic view of F. X. Godts, C.S.S.R., De paucitate salvandorum quid docuerunt sancti? [Brussels, 1899], is ably evaluated); the "traditional" view on the lot of unbaptized infants is vigorously defended. The one adverse criticism this reviewer would enter against an otherwise singularly successful work of popularization concerns the chapter on pre­destination and predilection: both the introduction of the topic and the solution offered seem untimely and unsatisfactory.

Alma College

William A. Huesman, S.J.


This volume with its narrow subject seems, at first sight, to be out of place in the great series in which it appears. It examines the Ordinary of the Mass as found in the practice of the Mainz diocese from the first printed missal (1458) onward, but with continual reference to MSS missals back as far as about 1300. The examination is conducted in careful detail for the period up to 1602, frequent comparison being made with the usage of the Cologne and Trier dioceses and occasional comparison with strictly Roman usage. Up to the missal of 1602 the Mainz usage was one of many local variations that had over the centuries grown out of and developed around ancient Roman usage in so far as this latter had reached the north countries through the earlier medieval sacramentaries. The missal of 1602 shows the first influences of the Tridentine reform; the author in this section points out the changes that thus came about in the older Mainz usage (pp. 98–113). From 1698 on (pp. 114–15) the Tridentine-Roman rite has held full sway, the Mainz Proprium sanctorum being the only relict of former days. The value of the book and the reason why it is rightly included in this series, despite its limited subject, lie in two facts: (1) it is one of many such books that will have to be written in order to fill out the history of the Mass in the Middle Ages, now that the main lines of the medieval Roman liturgy have been researched and its structure established; (2) Mainz, along with Cologne and Trier, was one of the most important dioceses of the Middle Ages; the importance was not merely political: Mainz exercised great liturgical influence
through the Rhenish Mass Ordo and more generally through the Romano-
German Pontifical which was compiled at Mainz about 950 (cf. J. A. Jung-
mann, *The Mass of the Roman Rite*, new revised and abridged version in one
volume [New York, 1960], pp. 70-74). In his conclusion R. sketches briefly
a correlation of the development he has traced in the Mainz Mass liturgy,
with the liturgical characteristics of the successive periods of Western
Geistesgeschichte as outlined in the too-little-known articles of A. L. Mayer
in the *Jahrbuch für Liturgiewissenschaft* and in its continuation, the *Archiv
für Liturgiewissenschaft*.

*Woodstock College*

**M. J. O'Connell, S.J.**

**St. Bernard of Clairvaux: The Story of His Life as Recorded in
the Vita Prima Bernardi by Certain of His Contemporaries, William
of St. Thierry, Arnold of Bonnevaux, Geoffrey and Philip of
Clairvaux, and Odo of Deuil.** Translated by Geoffrey Webb and Adrian
the recollections which his contemporaries have recorded about him are not
always the best place to start when attempting to understand a saint, they
usually are a port of eventual call. The *Vita prima Bernardi* is no exception.
Written with a view to edification and to promoting Bernard’s canonization,
the *Vita* has its limitations. However, sufficiently warned in the brief intro­
duction what these limitations are, the average reader will find in this first
translation of the *Vita* into English an easy-reading version of the major
part of the original work. Since the present translation was not prepared
with a scholarly audience in mind, the reader will find few notes other than
identifications of scriptural references, nor is a bibliography appended.

*Woodstock College*  

**James G. McCann, S.J.**

**Faithful Servant: Spiritual Retreats and Letters of Blessed
Claude la Colombière.** Translated by William J. Young, S.J. St. Louis:
Herder, 1960. Pp. viii + 450. $6.50. Fr. Francis de la Chaize had been
Provincial of the Jesuit Province of Lyons only five months when he became
the confessor of Louis XIV. His most important decision during those five
months was the seemingly singular assignment of Fr. Claude la Colombière, a
skilful teacher and cultivated preacher, to the obscure village of Paray-le-
Monial. Here Fr. la Colombière met Sister Margaret Mary of the Visitation
Convent and became her support and counselor in transmitting to the world
the revelations of the Sacred Heart. A man of exceptional familiarity and
generosity with God, he was referred to by the Sacred Heart as "my faithful
servant and perfect friend." This volume is his personal expression of his
own deep interior life. Y., using the Grenoble edition of the *Oeuvres complètes* of Fr. la Colombière, has nicely translated Blessed Claude’s notes made during two retreats, some additional spiritual reflections, his act of consecration to the Sacred Heart, and 148 of his letters. One retreat was the Long Retreat made during his tertianship, the other when he was in London as preacher to the Duchess of York. Unfortunately, in a large number of the letters the integral feeling of Blessed Claude has been lost. In 1715, when the letters were first published, out of courtesy to several living recipients of the letters and in fear of giving the Jansenists occasion for further attacks on the Society of Jesus, the editors deleted several sections. Yet, despite this regrettable mutilation with its consequent unnaturalness of style, Blessed Claude’s courtesy and even playfulness break through. *Faithful Servant* opens up another vein in the rich mine of the spirituality of France of the seventeenth century.

*St. Andrew-on-Hudson*  
*William V. Bangert, S.J.*

**LETTRES AUX FRATERNITÉS.** By René Voillaume. 2 vols. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1960. Pp. 406, 341. 12 fr., 9.50 fr. The Prior of the Petits Frères de Jésus published in 1950 the now well-known *Au coeur des masses*, a collection of conferences to novices, of extracts from letters, and of meditations, written during the years 1936–50. These new volumes are a sort of sequel to the earlier work. It is a tribute to the ideals of the Petits Frères, to V.’s powers of presentation, and, ultimately, to the spiritual genius of Charles de Foucauld, that these pages, though addressed to a limited audience and published primarily for the use of the Petits Frères and Petites Soeurs, will profit any who read them. The earlier work was a fairly rounded exposition of the religious ideals of the Brotherhoods; the new work (whose material is drawn from the years 1949 ff.) rather delves more deeply into certain problems. The two volumes differ somewhat among themselves: the first contains eight lengthy letters or, better, small treatises on vocation, Eucharist, spiritual friendship, charity, prayer, spiritual childhood, and obedience (pp. 11–267), along with briefer “Notes on the Apostolate of the Brotherhoods” (pp. 271–368); the second contains ninety-five short pieces, in the form, equivalently, of a diary, written in all parts of the world and commenting on a great variety of subjects. Each volume has an analytic index enabling the reader to pursue through the two volumes any theme that interests him. The paradoxical juxtaposition of place and topic—V. writes from an African desert retreat on the Church and the socialist state, from Chicago on routine, from New York on contemplative prayer—is symbolic
of V.'s vision of the spiritual unity of the contemporary world and of his constantly stimulating confrontation of the Gospel and the indefinable but real creature, "modern man."

Woodstock College M. J. O'Connell, S.J.

THE BORDERLAND: AN EXPLORATION OF THEOLOGY IN ENGLISH LITERATURE. By Roger Lloyd. London: Allen and Unwin, 1960. Pp. 111. 16s. This is an attempt to sketch out, in brief compass, the broad lines of a mysterious "borderland" between the two kingdoms of theology and literature, a land in which the truths of Christian theology are "translated" into the literary language of poetry and prose. Among the residents of L.'s borderland are Defoe, Thomas Hughes, Emily Bronte, Charles Williams, Dorothy Sayers, C. S. Lewis, and (pre-eminently) G. K. Chesterton. L. has made a fine contribution to both literature and theology, in pointing out the importance of the long-neglected problem of the relationship between these two areas of knowledge. As in any such approach to the problem of theology and literature, certain cautions must be made. It is not true, either de jure or de facto, that "the modern literary artist has at last won the unreserved and glad recognition of the Church as a theological teacher on equal terms and of a like authority with his more professional senior" (p. 50). Such a view fully respects the rights neither of theology nor of literature. The profound and intimate relationship between theological truth and the truth of the literary imagination will only come clear if the autonomies of both are respected; theology may indeed occasionally be literature (witness St. Augustine), but it is not literature for the same reason that it is theology. At the same time, L. has pointed to a real and important truth: there is a literature which must be appreciated and evaluated not merely as art but as theology—the work of "borderland" artists like Milton, Chesterton, C. S. Lewis. And, we might add, thus to evaluate them is not to move outside the function and framework of literary criticism itself.

Woodstock College J. Robert Barth, S.J.

A LIST OF BOOKS IN ENGLISH ABOUT THE EASTERN CHURCHES. Compiled by Donald Attwater. Newport, R.I.: St. Leo Shop, 1960. Pp. xvii + 22. Mimeographed, $1.75. Leo McMahon's stimulating and closely written Foreword on "The Concept of Rite: An Approach to Eastern Catholic Worship" draws on papal documents and a number of contemporary writers, Catholic and Orthodox, to make many good observations on the ethos and theological wealth of the Eastern liturgies. The book list contains two hundred briefly annotated items (plus a list of twenty-eight pamphlets),
covering early Church history, Byzantine history and culture, general works on the non-Uniate Churches, the Eastern Orthodox Church (numerous subdivisions, including doctrine, liturgy, spirituality, monasticism, Church art), the lesser Eastern Churches, the Uniate Churches, hagiography, and the schism. This list would serve admirably as a guide to seminaries and colleges in building up a library section on the Eastern rites.

Woodstock College

M. J. O'Connell, S.J.

ZUR Ethischen BEGründung der Todesstrafe heute. By Gustav Ermecke. Paderborn: Schöningh, 1959. Pp. 41. Sheds needed light on a question that is the topic of international debate: Does the state have the right to inflict capital punishment? Really there are two questions involved: Does the state have the right, and if so, does prudence dictate that it be exercised in a given historical situation? Leaving the latter question to empiric science to determine, E. addresses himself to the ethical issue. First he clears the ground, dismissing the appeal to human feeling as a pertinent consideration. He then insists upon the necessity of accepting a common view of man and the state, if reasonable discussion is to ensue. Next he reviews at some length the chief arguments advanced to justify the death penalty: deterrence of the populace at large from crime, the nature and function of the state, legitimate self-defense, the principle of totality, and the restoration of balance to the order of right reason. All are found wanting without further support. Ultimately the only justification is the principle of forfeited right: the criminal forfeits his right to live in that he has destroyed the life of another. One who has denied the inviolability of human life cannot claim the right to live for himself. Accordingly, the state does not deprive him of this right. It takes away the life itself of one who has deprived himself of the right to live. E. goes far in clearing the air for sane discussion. The work is noteworthy for its incisive critique of the ethical principles involved.

Loyola Seminary, Shrub Oak, N.Y. Robert H. Springer, S.J.

EiNÜBING ins Philosophische Denken. By Wilhelm Keilbach. Munich: Hueber, 1960. Pp. 180. K. has taught the introductory course in philosophy for twenty years at Austrian and German universities and is presently professor of systematic Scholastic philosophy at Munich University. His book is almost a transcript of the outline of his lectures and thus it gives one the feel of the German classroom. The approach is in no way lugubrious and pretentious, but seeks to interest the beginner in sharing in the philosophical way of thinking. There is a great sensitivity shown to the
objection raised by positivism that there is no distinctive sort of philosophical knowledge. K. argues for a distinction among what he calls practical knowledge (ordinary and humanistic), scientific, and philosophical knowledges. He indicates some questions which can only be treated by using methods which do not belong to the natural sciences, taken in any definite sense. This introduction is distinguished by its almost total lack of contentiousness, by its hospitality to many modes of posing the philosophical problems, and by its closeness to the concerns of contemporary students. For instance, it discusses both the advantages and the shortcomings of the systematic way of philosophizing, which has to be supplemented by a more personal dialogue. On the question of Christian philosophy, K. rigorously limits himself to the early Maritain position of admitting an influence of faith upon one’s direction of research, while still requiring that the problems be both formulated and resolved in a properly philosophical way. There are some balanced remarks on phenomenology and philosophy of science, backed up by excellent bibliographies of the German literature and a few foreign items. This book will bring one quickly abreast with German discussions on the meaning of philosophy.

Saint Louis University

J. G. Hamann, 1730–1788: A Study in Christian Existence. By Ronald Gregor Smith. New York: Harper, 1960. Pp. 270. $5.00. During the past decade, J. Nadler has edited a six-volume edition of the works of Hamann and written a full-length study of his life and thought. But apart from a few articles and monographs of a restricted nature, there has not been anything substantial on Hamann in English until this work by the Scottish theologian, R. G. Smith. The first part consists of a biographical sketch, along with a description of Hamann’s position on these basic points: faith, the word, and history. In the longer second part (140 pp.) S. offers translations taken from Hamann’s main books and correspondence. Prior to existentialism, this “Magus in the north” could claim only a marginal position in the history of philosophy and theology. He was a gadfly to Kant and Mendelssohn, criticizing their confidence in reason and their acceptance of the Enlightenment. He sympathized with Herder for stressing the historicity of being, and with Jacobi for giving faith a basic role. But recently Hamann has come to the fore by virtue of his influence on Kierkegaard’s notion of faith and the present instant, as well as his bearing on Tillich’s view of the authoritative word and theonomous reason. Hamann finds the religious relationship not so much in the Kierkegaardian individual as in the whole present situation of the world, so that the religious response is never
separable from the countertendencies and ambivalences in the world. Anyone planning to tackle his orphic sayings and obscure images must be prepared to honor at full face value Hamann's own declaration that his aptitude does not lie in system construction but in "crumbs, fragments, fancies, sudden inspirations." A detailed interpretative framework drawn from the German Enlightenment and Sturm und Drang is indispensable baggage for really mastering his thought.

Saint Louis University

James Collins

Eucharistiefeiern in der Christenheit. Edited by Theodor Bogler, O.S.B. Liturgie und Mönchturn 26. Maria Laach: Ars Liturgica, 1960. Pp. 139. DM 3.— Christ's command, "Do this as a memorial of me," referred to no specific rite or even to a schematic outline of a rite. Through the centuries extensive and varied rites were developed in many Christian lands to encase the Church's repetition of Christ's act at the Supper. To give an impression of the manifold wealth of Eucharistic liturgies and to allow a comparative study, a selection of these is here presented. After a short chapter on the NT Eucharist, brief essays by various hands, giving a modicum of historical orientation and describing the Mass with emphasis on its structure, are devoted to the Byzantine liturgies, to the Armenian, Maronite, Ambrosian, and Mozarabic Masses, and to the Mass of the Lyons rite and the rite of the Dominican Order. The second half of the book offers descriptions of the Lord's Supper as celebrated in the Church of England, in the German Evangelical Church, in the Danish state Church, in Sweden, at Taizé, and in various of the better-known sects (Jehovah's Witnesses, Neuapostolische Kirche, etc.). The editor concludes with a few pages on questions that arise concerning the "Mass of the Future." An informative brochure that offers much in brief compass.

Studi di scienze ecclesiastiche. Aloisiana 1. Naples: Pontifical Theological Faculty of St. Aloysius, 1960. Pp. 352. The seven essays, as their titles indicate and the bibliography attached to each amply proves, deal with subjects on which a good deal has been written in recent years, even if there has not been in every case the same amount of hot debate. In detail, there are five more or less lengthy studies, followed by two briefer notes: S. Porubcan, S.J., on the De profundis; L. Fedele, on hope in St. Paul; S. Caiazzo, S.J., on reason and revelation in Emil Brunner; A. Di Marino, S.J., on obedience; G. M. Fazzari, S.J., on the philosophy of values; F. Bruno, S.J., on apostolic tradition at Trent; and M. Errichetti, S.J., on Ite missa est. A felicitous beginning for a new collection.
MISCELÁNEA ANTONIO PEREZ Goyena. Special number of Estudios eclesiásticos, Vol. 35. Madrid: Ediciones “Fax,” 1960. Pp. 478. Fr. Goyena (1863—), in a long and indefatigable lifetime of writing (cf. bibliography, pp. 32-48), has concentrated his labors on the history, especially ecclesiastical, of Navarre, and on the history of theology in Spain (American readers will recall that G. contributed ten articles on various of the great Spanish Jesuit theologians to the Catholic Encyclopedia 9-15). This volume in his honor reflects his interests. The second part (pp. 337-476) contains eleven essays on the history and culture of Navarre; the first (pp. 53-334), fifteen essays on the history of theology in Spain. Of especially current interest may be mentioned: “En torno al género bíblico,” by Eleuterio Elorduy, S.J. (pp. 113-32); “El axioma ‘Facienti quod est in se Deus non denegat gratiam’ en el P. Luis de Molina,” by José Hellin, S.J. (pp. 171-99); “Nota sobre el autor y el contenido de la primera ‘Mariologia’ ” (on Plácido Nigido, S.J., ca. 1570-ca. 1640), by Augusto Segovia, S.J. (pp. 287-311); and “Probabilismo racional, prudente y necesario; pero insuficiente,” by Marcelino Zalba, S.J. (pp. 313-34).

THE GUIDE TO CATHOLIC LITERATURE 6 (1956-59). Edited by Walter Romig. Villanova, Pa.: Catholic Library Association, 1960. Pp. 725. $17.50. This cumulated volume of the Guide continues the excellent tradition established by its editor. Not only is there basic information about Catholic books of the period covered but also annotations in the form of one- or two-sentence quotations from book reviews; and frequently there are references to other reviews not quoted. All languages are included and the editor attempts to itemize not only all Catholic authors but all books that have any bearing on the doctrine, history, and literature of the Catholic Church. Books are entered under author, title, and subject. Frequently a brief note concerning a new author is given. The typographical arrangement and product are both excellent.
BOOKS RECEIVED

[All books received are listed here whether they are reviewed or not]

Scriptural Studies


Doctrinal Theology


**Moral Theology, Canon Law, Liturgical Questions**


**History and Biography, Patristics**


Blondel, Maurice, et al. *Au coeur de la crise moderniste: Le dossier inédit*


Pastoral and Ascetical Theology, Devotional Literature


Philosophical Questions


**Special Questions**


Dresner, Samuel H. *The Zaddik: The Doctrine of the Zaddik according to the


### SIGLA

#### OLD TESTAMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbr.</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gn</td>
<td>Genesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex</td>
<td>Exodus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lv</td>
<td>Leviticus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nm</td>
<td>Numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dt</td>
<td>Deuteronomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jos</td>
<td>Joshua</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jg</td>
<td>Judges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ru</td>
<td>Ruth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 S</td>
<td>1, 2 Samuel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 K</td>
<td>1, 2 Kings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Chr</td>
<td>1, 2 Chronicles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ezr</td>
<td>Ezra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neh</td>
<td>Nehemiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Est</td>
<td>Esther</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ps</td>
<td>Psalms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prv</td>
<td>Proverbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qoh</td>
<td>Qoheleth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ct</td>
<td>Song of Songs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is</td>
<td>Isaiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jer</td>
<td>Jeremiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lam</td>
<td>Lamentations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ez</td>
<td>Ezekiel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dn</td>
<td>Daniel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hos</td>
<td>Hosea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jl</td>
<td>Joel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amos</td>
<td>Amos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ob</td>
<td>Obadiah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jon</td>
<td>Jonah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mi</td>
<td>Micah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na</td>
<td>Nahum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hb</td>
<td>Habakkuk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zeph</td>
<td>Zephaniah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hg</td>
<td>Haggai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Za</td>
<td>Zechariah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mal</td>
<td>Malachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bar</td>
<td>Baruch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tob</td>
<td>Tobit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jud</td>
<td>Judith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wis</td>
<td>Wisdom of Solomon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sir</td>
<td>Ben Sira</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Mac</td>
<td>1, 2 Maccabees</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### NEW TESTAMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbr.</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mt</td>
<td>Matthew</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mk</td>
<td>Mark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lk</td>
<td>Luke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jn</td>
<td>John</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acts</td>
<td>Acts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rom</td>
<td>Romans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Cor</td>
<td>1, 2 Corinthians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gal</td>
<td>Galatians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eph</td>
<td>Ephesians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phil</td>
<td>Philippians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Col</td>
<td>Colossians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Th</td>
<td>1, 2 Thessalonians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Tim</td>
<td>1, 2 Timothy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tit</td>
<td>Titus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phm</td>
<td>Philemon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heb</td>
<td>Hebrews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jas</td>
<td>James</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2 Pt</td>
<td>1, 2 Peter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1, 2, 3 Jn</td>
<td>1, 2, 3 John</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jude</td>
<td>Jude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ap</td>
<td>Apocalypse</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>